|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Digital Learning Advisory Council (DLAC)**  **Meeting Minutes** | | dese logo |
| **Date:** | December 20, 2023 | |
| **Time:** | 12:30 PM – 2:00 PM | |
| **Location:** | Remote Participation - online | |
| **Attendee Information:** | **DLAC members:**  Daniel Downs, Bill Silver, Elizabeth Tripathi, Sarah Haavind, Scott Morrison, Kate DeMello, Stacy Young. Jared Perrine, Cynthia Yetman  **Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) staff:**  Ruth Hersh, Andrea Cote, Jackie Gantzer, Jacqueline Monterroso, Eileen Belastock  **Guests:** Jim Flanagan | |

* **Welcome**
* **Introductions of Remote Participants**
* **Review and Approve Minutes from September 2023, DLAC Meeting (roll call)**
  + Motion to accept minutes – so moved Cynthia. Second Beth Tripathi.
  + Daniel Downs - yea, Bill Silver - yes, Elizabeth Tripathi - yes, Sarah Haavind - aye, Kate DeMello - approve, Stacy Young - yes. Jared Perrine - yes, Cynthia Yetman - approve
* **Artificial Intelligence**
  + High-Level Introduction – DESE
    - DESE has not come out with formal guidance related to new developments in AI. Quickly evolving. Difficult to create a policy and recommendation that is relevant to all stakeholders and contexts – lack of evidence/research based on its impact. Following the development of U.S. Department of Education (USED) guidance. <https://tech.ed.gov/ai/>. The USED Office of EdTech has a charge to explore.
    - Three key things to keep in mind as we navigate these topics: prioritizing cybersecurity and data privacy; leveraging digital literacy computer science (DLCS) standards (thinking about how to use artificial intelligence (AI) in classrooms, do they have skills to use technology in safe ways; clear focus on equity and racial equity how will AI impact students who are historically the least well served.
    - Governor Healey just established a statewide task force out of the Executive Office of Technology Services and Security (EOTSS) – trying to figure out how K-12 education will be situated in that task force.
    - We want your insights and perspectives on how the DLAC will benefit our possible engagement with the task force and think about how we might best respond to support districts.
    - Student Data Privacy:
      * <https://sdpc.a4l.org/view_alliance.php?state=MA>MA DESE DLCS: <https://www.doe.mass.edu/stem/dlcs/default.html>
      * Governor Healey:<https://statescoop.com/massachusetts-ai-climate-change-draft-plan-healey/>
  + What is AI – what is the concept in the field?
    - Member: We have moved to generative AI.
    - Member: Can we come up with topics about how AI can impact students – use for academic work, influence on mental health/social media, parent understanding of the technology, data privacy realm – how are AI gathering data on students and for what purpose?
    - Member: Teachers are asking about AI. We need to give guidance – how does it impact a teacher's job right now, how can I tell if a kid is plagiarizing? Longer term – how can teachers properly use these tools? Our district just rolled out a data analytics platform, vendor wanted to introduce an AI element, I asked what kind of privacy agreement the AI company had in place. Concern about AI getting a hold of student data.
    - Member: Staff are asking how do we know if students are using AI? It is not that different from a kid using Google to put a paper together – made it easy to determine where kids got information then. Concerning – a number of staff who want us to open AI up to them to generate lesson plans. Districts spend money on curriculum which includes lesson plans. Districts must have policies on how teachers use AI and for what purpose.
    - Member: Making sure we are talking about the readiness gap, look at research and data – generative AI could make significant disruption to the labor market. By 2034, AI may create entirely new industries and career paths. Future of jobs report from World Economic Forum– identify skill set kids will use (and adults) – list of skills that are needed. We are preparing students for an unknown future as they navigate K-12; they need a skill set to ensure they can participate and contribute to the economy.
  + How is it being used in K-12 public education today?
    - Member: Staff asking if they can use it to generate lesson plans.
    - Member: Whittier Tech is rolling out some AI tools for their staff and doing professional development around some of the new tools.
  + What are the potential benefits?
    - Member: Develop new skill sets for students. Some may be hesitant to embrace it, fear, and unknowns.
    - Member: AI is good at churning data. Takes in a vast array of information and turns it into something meaningful. The most powerful thing we can take from it. Especially when we think about teaching students to draw conclusions from data and allow districts to evaluate their own outcomes.
  + Other Questions (for now or another meeting)
    - What are the potential challenges of using AI in K-12 public education?
      * Member: Ensuring that students and teachers who consume media/content generated by AI know that it may not be real. How can we ensure that consumers are critical of the resources they encounter?
      * Member: Senator Markey’s office has created a toolkit for social media and media literacy.
      * DESE – DLCS sets expectations that students and teachers check sources and analyze information that they are seeing. There is a strong variation in which schools/districts prioritize integrating standards into their daily instruction. How can we ensure that all students have access to those standards and key skills?
    - What are some local examples of what you in the field are dealing with?
    - Do you have local policies regarding AI?
      * Ethics for educators’ guidance -
    - Identify comment challenges.
      * Member: I am treating it as any other piece of technology. Staff should attend MassCUE roundtable. Tory Trust helped run that event. People should get involved in events to discuss.
      * Member: Not a lot of local folks speaking about AI. Typically, vendor or third party, worried that teachers are learning about AI from a vendor who is selling something, rather than a non-biased entity.
    - Problem-solving and best practices.
      * Member: Can we invite Justin Reich to come to these meetings to discuss this? He has been talking about this for 10 years.
      * Guest: Adam Garry and Tara Nattrass (both formerly with Dell) are good resources.
      * Member: Bill Daggett an excellent speaker and "futurist"
      * Guest: The International Society for Technology in Education (ISTE) is another good resource.
    - Can the state Department of Education help address these issues? If so, how?
      * Member: How can DESE help provide guidance for students, teachers, administrators, and parents?
      * Member: We need to define vocabulary on AI. Real basis glossary for AI, augmented reality (AR), and virtual reality (VR). Bring people up to speed with the concepts by defining them. Could help with equity to ensure that all districts have the same information and ideas of the general benefits/worries.
      * DESE: Could be helpful to just define what is AI.
      * Member: We could define what is generative, what is predictive analytics.
      * Member: That transition from knowing about what AI is to more generative purposes, how does that affect machine learning? People enter into it at different levels, big mystery what is currently happening in the classroom – different knowledge bases/understanding can lead to equity gaps.
      * DESE: One of the values of DLAC is giving DESE many ideas. Is there a way that DLAC can prioritize, this is the one we can align on which is the starting place, or these are the top three things that we would like the state to address first?
      * DESE: We are monitoring other state departments of education and collaborating with them.
      * Member: We can look at this list and narrow it down during our next meeting.
* **Data Privacy** 
  + What are the critical issues surrounding data privacy in public schools?
    - Member: TEC Education Collaborative is an amazing resource. They have shared approved resources as they come out. Do they want to share with us on this issue? Could they have a representative?
    - Member: Student data privacy is so far down their list of teacher to-dos. If they use different apps, or not a strong system to vet those tools in their district, teachers could use some self-directed PD/guidance for teachers to make safe choices for themselves and their students. PD should lead to PD points for recertification.
    - Member: Many districts ask teachers to do self-assessments for cybersecurity. We ask teachers to inform themselves about cybersecurity, but there is a disconnect between what is approved and unapproved in a classroom. Teachers sometimes use unapproved. Google moved to a third-party application that requires parent consent – YouTube, translate – now districts have to get consent for that. Thank goodness that there is a data privacy that Google upholds. But by the end of October, Google stopped blocking third-party applications to districts, districts had to check in with teachers who enabled them without permission. These are not vetted resources.
  + What types of data are collected in public schools?
    - Member: Most of the SIS have data privacy agreements.
  + What are the potential risks?
    - Member: Districts with older student information systems (SIS) – staff have been given a global view for a long time. Staff could look at students who they did not teach.
    - DESE: Are staff/educators aware that there are data privacy rules – Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA), and Children's Online Privacy Protection Act (COPPA)? Make sure that they know it is the responsibility of every educator, not just tech staff. Human error is the biggest risk in this area.
    - Member: When students can’t use a digital resource, it is difficult to find an equitable resource to substitute. A challenge to educate teachers to understand the multiple layers and understand the data privacy responsibilities. Need to educate parents as well.
    - Member: Lots of adult data that could be breached. Need to educate folks on how to protect payroll data. We are hiring companies to see how far they can get into their systems.
    - Member: Municipal cyber security training should be provided to teachers.
  + Other Questions (for now or another meeting)
    - In general, what strategies is the field using to safeguard student information?
    - What local policies are you aware of on how school districts are addressing these issues?
      * Member: Depends on who you ask. Teachers would love more guidance.
      * Member: Teachers have access to so many tools. How do they choose safely? TEC Education Collaborative has done a great job of alerting us. Any policies beyond acceptable use?
  + Identify comment challenges.
  + Problem-solving and best practices.
  + Can the state Department of Education help address these issues? If so, how?
* **DESE’s Updates on Commonwealth Virtual Schools (CMVS) and Single District Virtual Schools (SDVS) (Alison Bagg, Jacqueline Monterroso, Esther Jeong, & Ruth Hersh)** 
  + Achievement Data from CMVS and SDVS
    - Member: Can we talk about this data at the next meeting? Need more time to take a look as we received it just today. DESE – yes.
    - Member: Remember that students at the CMVS take the Massachusetts Comprehensive Assessment System (MCAS) in person at conference centers in a mode that does not represent their learning environment (at home).
  + Legislative Report – still in process.
  + CMVS application in process from the proposed Felix Commonwealth Virtual School
* Review Panel
* Learning Management System (LMS) Presentation
* Public Hearing (December 6)
* Public Comment (Deadline December 22)
* Interview (January 9)
* **Education Technology Team Update (Jacqulyn Gantzer, A.J. Cote, Eileen Belastock)**
  + DESE: Digital equity research – will have information for you in January. Will have a finalized research plan and tools.
* **2023-24 Meeting Schedule** 
  + Wednesday, September 27th
  + Wednesday, December 20th
  + Wednesday, March 20th
  + Wednesday, June 12th
* **Adjourn**
  + **Member – motion to adjourn; seconded**
  + **Roll call**
  + Daniel Downs - yes, Bill Silver – left early Elizabeth Tripathi - yes, Sarah Haavind - yes, Scott Morrison- yes, Kate DeMello - yes, Stacy Young – yes, Jared Perrine - yes, Cynthia Yetman - yes