The public comment period for the Draft Revised Arts Curriculum Framework opened on February 15 and concluded on April 23, 2019. Consistent with recent framework revisions, Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE) collected comments using a survey. We received 301 survey responses. Respondents were invited to comment on all or part of the draft framework. The breakdown of comments by sections of the draft framework is below.

The majority of respondents (89.5 %) were not part of the development of the proposed revisions to the Framework, which is encouraging in terms of reaching a new audience for feedback. 80.7 % of respondents are classroom teachers. Respondents came from all regions across the state and represent a range of school settings: 44.6 % represent urban schools and 69.9% represent suburban or rural schools.

In addition to completing the survey, DESE invited commenters to provide line edits to the draft framework. The following commenters submitted such detailed feedback.

* Rachel Branham

Salem, Massachusetts

* Diane Feeley

Wachusett Regional School District

* Michael A. Genese

New Bedford Public Schools

* Allison Gover

Chelmsford Public Schools

* Lois Hetland

Massachusetts College of Art

* Melissa Mastrolia

Massachusetts Art Education Association

* Laura Netherwood

Springfield Public Schools

* Demerice Pallone

Holbrook Public Schools

* Allyn Phelps

Boston University

* Jonathan Rappaport

ArtsLearning

* Emily Ruddock

Arts for All Coalition

The following data summarizes the results of the public comment survey:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **General Prompts** | **Agree** | **Disagree** |
| Overall, the **Vision** section of the draft framework provides a clear and compelling description of the arts as central to a well-rounded education. | 85.7% | 14.3% |
| Overall, the **Guiding Principles** identify the most important characteristics of a high-quality arts education program. | 91.2% | 8.8% |
| The **Standards for Artistic Practice [Clusters]** in the draft framework are organized into four broad clusters… Overall, the draft framework presents an appropriate balance [ of instructional time]. | 91.3% | 8.7% |
| Overall, the **Standards for Artistic Practice** describe the most important skills students develop in the arts during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 90.2% | 9.8% |
| **Dance Prompts** |  |  |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide **greater detail** about what students should be able to demonstrate in dance during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 100% | 0% |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide a more **coherent organization** for the dance standards for grade pre-K to grade 12. | 66.7% | 33% |
| Overall, the dance content standards describe the most important relevant **knowledge, learning, or skills** that students should demonstrate in dance during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 100% | 0% |
| **Media Arts Prompts** |  |  |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide **greater detail** about what students should be able to demonstrate in media arts during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 88.9% | 11.1% |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide a more **coherent organization** for the media arts standards for grade pre-K to grade 12. | 77.8% | 22.2% |
| Overall, the media arts content standards describe the most important relevant **knowledge, learning, or skills** that students should demonstrate in media arts during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 88.9% | 11.1% |
| **Music Prompts** |  |  |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide **greater detail** about what students should be able to demonstrate in music during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 76.1% | 23.9% |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide a more **coherent organization** for the music standards for grade pre-K to grade 12. | 82.2% | 17.8% |
| Overall, the music content standards describe the most important relevant **knowledge, learning, or skills** that students should demonstrate in music during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 84.8% | 15.2% |
| **Theatre Prompts** |  |  |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide **greater detail** about what students should be able to demonstrate in theatre during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 80% | 20% |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide a more **coherent organization** for the theatre standards for grade pre-K to grade 12. | 90% | 10% |
| Overall, the theatre content standards describe the most important relevant **knowledge, learning, or skills** that students should demonstrate in theatre during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 80% | 20% |
| **Visual Arts Prompts** |  |  |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide **greater detail** about what students should be able to demonstrate in visual arts during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 77.6% | 22.4% |
| Overall, the proposed changes provide a more **coherent organization** for the visual arts standards for grade pre-K to grade 12. | 80.2% | 19.8% |
| Overall, the visual arts content standards describe the most important relevant knowledge, learning, or skills that students should demonstrate in visual arts during their pre-K to grade 12 education. | 82.7% | 17.3% |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| The following table documents areas addressed as DESE refined the draft Framework in response to public comment. | |
| **Revisions Informed by Public Comment** | |
| **Need to emphasize specific concepts and skills** | |
| **Evidence: 42 survey responses** | **DESE Response** |
| Feedback indicated that many respondents felt the draft Framework undercuts the importance of specific skills/concepts/vocabulary. Some feedback counter-indicated the Framework streamlines and allows for autonomy. In response to perceived lack of concepts and skills in Framework, Arts for All Coalition has created a resource that provides further detail in Music.   * “Elementary students need to learn basic skills, they need to learn rhythms and music symbols. They need to learn to read music notation. They need to learn about composers. They need to move to music. They need to learn folk songs...” * “I preferred the narrower scope of skills in the previous frameworks.” * “The standards do not describe specific skills and are very vague.” * “I feel as if this is an extremely dumbed down version of the old frameworks. It is way too broad and general and lacks the rigor and specifics of the old standards. I liked how the old standards said specifically what they should know (like breaking down the elements of art in standard 2).” * “…could be improved by including more details on skills, vocabulary, and providing a specific sequence for each grade level.” | * Revised content standards to provide explicit examples of when students would learn specific skills and concepts. * Revised the section titled “What the Framework Does and Does Not Do” to clarify the importance of local flexibility in determining which technical skills, concepts, and academic vocabulary to emphasize, and at which grade levels or courses to introduce and refine them. * Added Appendix for the Development of Singing as an example skill development aligned to the framework. Future implementation guides will provide resources for all five arts disciplines. |
| **Need to clarify the balance of time for four clusters of Standards for Artistic Practice** | |
| **Evidence: 19 survey responses** | **DESE Response** |
| Feedback indicated that several respondents interpreted the clusters of practices introduced in the draft Framework as needing to be equally weighted, which is a challenge due to a lack of instructional time and perceived differences in cluster importance.   * “Creating new ideas is an excellent concept but I am not sure it is an exactly even split in the amount of time vs. performance time. Conversely, if it is a composition class, more time should be spent on the creating...” * “In the districts that I have worked in I don't feel that adequate art class time is provided for students in grades pre-k -8th grade in order to properly provide time for the standards of responding and connecting.” * “Having 50% of standards focused on responding and connecting will drastically reduce the opportunities for creating in my urban classroom. I see my students once a week for 40 minutes - that adds up to about 24 hours a year...” | * Revised the overview section for the Artistic Practices emphasizing the flexibility districts have in implementing the framework, and specifically balancing time spent on each practice. |
| **Need to further elaborate on various topics related to a well-rounded arts education** | |
| **Arts Appreciation: BESE comments, 7 survey responses** | **DESE Response** |
| Feedback from Board of Elementary and Secondary Education, echoed by several respondents, indicated a need for including more attention to arts appreciation.   * “It seems to me that connotations of the Western classical conception of music and music making are ever present throughout this document, especially with the sections on reading notation.” * “Since ‘popular’ forms of art are most often influenced in some way by ‘masterworks’ that have stood the test of time, emphasis should be placed on student exposure to such works.” | * Revised Vision statement to emphasize artistic literacy and art appreciation. * Revised Guiding Principles, including adding a Guiding Principle related to artistic literacy. * Added specific connection standards to relate content across arts disciplines and with standards from the 2018 History and Social Science Curriculum Framework. * Added an Appendix for EL and Inclusion |
| **Cultural Inclusivity: 15 survey responses** |
| Majority of feedback indicated that the draft Framework appropriately emphasizes the importance of cultural diversity, especially in Guiding Principle 4. Some feedback indicated the need for support in building more culturally responsive arts classrooms, to re-examine how statements are worded, and to include additional examples throughout the Framework that are more culturally inclusive.   * “America is a melting pot of cultures, so the idea of utilizing the arts to have students familiar with genres, styles, music, dance, theater, art, etc. from various cultures and time periods is great.” * “I think this is an area where folks need to ensure they aren't using multi-culturalism as tool to provide token experiences...or appropriating cultural experiences into artistic ones...” * “that is really important the art works are not used in culturally insensitive ways. This can be very complicated and sadly is not shared in the best way…” |
| **Arts Integration: Arts For All letter, 9 survey responses** |
| The draft Framework’s treatment of arts integration was discussed extensively throughout the development process, with the ultimate debate being whether to address it as Guiding Principle or set of additional standards in the Framework. Ultimately, DESE decided to include arts integration as a Guiding Principle. Survey responses were mixed regarding whether the Guiding Principle is a sufficient push for arts integration. Several survey responses expressed caution over including arts integration in the standards.   * “A caution: When referring to arts integration, it is important to specify that in this approach, one subject is not in service of the other, rather both are learned simultaneously with each subject supporting the other…” |
| **Inclusion/Universal Design for Learning/Social Emotional Learning: 7 survey responses** |
| Majority of feedback indicated that the Framework does a great job of indicating the importance of inclusion, especially in Guiding Principle 9. Some feedback indicated a desire to see Inclusion, UDL, and SEL further developed throughout the Framework.   * “…if possible, some examples about how to universally design and/or scaffold activities to make them more inclusive throughout would also be helpful.” |
| **Artistic Literacy: Arts For All letter, 6 survey responses** |
| Majority of feedback indicated that the Framework defines artistic literacy well in the introduction, though some survey responses indicated a desire to see it further embedded throughout the document.   * “It should emphasize the importance of ‘artistic literacy,’ not just ‘literacy’ in the opening section.” |