The Center for Instructional Support, of the Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (MA ESE), worked with nine Massachusetts school districts to establish professional learning networks (PLNs) that piloted the MA Equity Plan during the 2015-16 school year. Of the nine districts, Boston, Milton, and Taunton chose cultural proficiency as a strategy to address some of the equity gaps they identified. The following document summarizes the insights from these three districts.

The Boston public schools serve approximately 53,530 students in 125 schools.
The Milton public schools serve approximately 3,900 students in six schools.
The Taunton public schools serve approximately 8,038 students in 13 schools.

The Department is grateful for the districts’ sharing of their goals, challenges, lessons learned, successes, and useful resources and for their deep commitment to equitable access to high quality education for every child in Massachusetts.
What is Cultural Proficiency?

Understanding additional ways that districts defined cultural proficiency gives us insight into their basis for doing this work. Coming to a consensus on a definition can be difficult.

Boston used the following definition of culturally responsive teaching:

“Culturally responsive teaching is using the cultural knowledge, prior experience, frames of reference, and performance styles of ethnically diverse students to make learning encounters more relevant to and effective for them. The use of cultural referents in teaching bridges and explains the mainstream culture, while validating and affirming students’ own cultures.

Culturally responsive teaching uses students’ identities and backgrounds as meaningful sources for creating optimal learning environments. It entails immersing both students and teachers collaboratively in the process of developing an understanding and appreciation of multicultural perspectives through the study of rich content and the use of a variety of instructional practices. It teaches to and through the strengths of these students.”

Currently, Boston is very intentional about using the term Educational Equity to be more comprehensive. Educational equity includes engaging in non-discriminatory and inclusive practices, eliminating all achievement gaps by impacting classroom instruction, and creating learning environments where all students are valued and language, culture and social emotional wellness is well understood and sustained.

Taunton referenced the definition of cultural proficiency by Lindsey, Robins, and Terrell:

“Cultural proficiency is a model for shifting the culture of the school or district; it is a model for individual transformation and organizational change. Cultural proficiency is a mind-set, a world view, a way a person or an organization make assumptions for effectively describing, responding to, and planning for issues that arise in diverse environments. For some people, cultural proficiency is a paradigm shift from viewing cultural difference as problematic to learning how to interact effectively with other cultures.”

---


Milton defined cultural proficiency as the ability and capacity to effectively work cross-culturally with scholars, parents, and colleagues.

Dr. Karen Spaulding, a principal in Milton, said the district’s vision is that “every child, family, and staff member will feel that our district is a welcoming, culturally inclusive place to be, whatever that means for their role in the organization.”

PLNs raised questions which may be helpful as your district defines cultural proficiency:

- What does a culturally proficient district look like, in terms of policies and structures?
- What do culturally proficient principals do?
- What does a culturally proficient teacher do and what does the classroom look like?
- What does culturally responsive teaching look like?

**Lessons Learned/ Advice**

**Advice from participating districts**

- “Watch what teachers are doing. Talk things up. Have a way they can be involved. Give them a specific job within the realm of cultural proficiency, make them the expert, and then get them to speak to their colleagues.” – Rebecca Couet, Taunton’s Elementary Curriculum Coordinator

- “The only way change can happen is to step into the anxiety. The anxiety is palpable.” – Dan Anderson, Boston’s Director of Academic Response Teams

- “It’s a matter of coordinated continuity.” – Dr. Angela Burke, Milton’s K-12 Director of Educational Technology

- “This work is not about having an answer or a product. We need to focus on a process, in collaboration, and engage in sustained conversation.” – Becky Shuster, Boston’s Asst. Superintendent of Equity

- “Engage staff of color in dialogue is a series of meetings to engage in meaningful dialogue about cultural experiences, what a diverse faculty brings to the Milton Public schools, and Milton’s efforts to recruit and retain a diverse faculty that is reflective of the student body.” – Angela Burke

- “If we don’t spend time working on ourselves, our privilege could be too big to see past— it could be blinding us.” – Rebecca Couet

**ANECDOTAL EXAMPLE: What does it look like?**

In Taunton, a student responded to a writing prompt in a way that did not initially make sense to his teacher. The student later explained his written response: he thought a character was motivated to enter a race to earn money for rent, not out of personal interest. Then the teacher understood why the student selected an “incorrect” answer.
## SUCCESSES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Boston</th>
<th>Milton</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“We found commonalities of purpose among different offices, thereby breaking down silos. We became collaborative allies in the PLN work. We built a team, internally, and were strategic. We have buy-in and confidence in the group,” said Ceronne Daly, Director of Diversity Programs.</td>
<td>Milton has a history of engaging the community. The Cultural Competence Committee, led by a community member and a Milton director, is responsible for developing a plan to engage staff in meeting district, school, and individual goals to support culturally responsive teaching and student proficiency based on district staff input.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a district-wide commitment to this topic. The district is dedicating much of its professional learning to cultural proficiency.</td>
<td>There will be a district-wide read of <em>Blindspot</em> as a focus for school-based study groups.³</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taunton</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bring students in first, foremost, and more often. Bring their families too. Rebecca Couet explained that “getting their voices heard is the most powerful thing we’ve accomplished.”</td>
<td>“We changed the way we welcome people to our schools. For example, new families now come to our Welcome Center rather than being sent to different schools for each child,” Rebecca Couet said.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## What data did you use to determine your district’s equity gaps?

The districts used data on student access to different types of teachers from the Student Learning Experience (SLE) Report as a beginning, and districts were invited to also use data they were already collecting. By triangulating the data, districts could be more certain about their equity gap conclusions. The districts were thinking about equity and working toward equitable access before the formation of their Equity PLN. Being in the pilot and identifying equity gaps

through analysis of the SLE report and other data has been a way for them to broaden and deepen work they had already started.

“In 2013, the Boston Public Schools embarked on an endeavor to fully understand the barriers to educational opportunity and attainment for Black and Latino male students by commissioning a two-part study that collectively represents the most comprehensive body of work to date in the country on this topic.”

The study provides data points for equity and identifies areas for improvement.

The Boston PLN team began by requesting support from ESE on how to use Edwin Analytics. When they understood the function of the SLE Report, it became clear that every school could identify their own equity gaps and would need support to address them. This had a significant impact on the next phase of their equity work and it is one reason they continued to meet monthly for the rest of the school year. They knew that they had to be intentional, using data to drive decisions. “The key was to disaggregate the data to define the challenges and move toward a comprehensive approach to address systemic inequities,” said Kris Taylor, Boston’s Director of Leadership Development.

Boston analyzed state testing results and data about: English Learners; special education students; students’ and families’ socio-economic status; access to opportunities; enrollment in Advanced Work Classes and exam schools; disparities in discipline based on race; the significantly lower percentage of teachers of color compared to students of color; student voice; and high teacher expectations for all students.

Milton used a comprehensive report for the district that is broken up by subgroups, including race, gender, income, special education, and participation in sports and clubs. This data affects many of their decisions, including an examination of their hiring practices and commitment to hiring more educators who look like the students.

Districts built upon work they were already doing to address their equity gaps. For example, Milton had a practice of identifying students who did not meet the standards in ELA or mathematics by strongly encouraging them to attend before-school, after-school, and/or Saturday support sessions. Because Milton has a goal for all children to enroll in calculus and wants to assure that every student has access to higher level courses, additional support is offered to students during the summer, during which students who want to learn the higher level math are pre-taught the content at the district’s expense. Principals are committed to giving students, all students, access to this support; they often help them find rides to get to the summer programs.

---

Prioritizing equity is a crucial step.

Boston had been making equity a priority before they participated in MA ESE’s pilot PLNs. The following were happening in the district and paralleled their PLN work:

- Two new positions were added: The Assistant Superintendent for Equity and the Assistant Superintendent of Opportunity and the Achievement Gap.
- A task force was convened over the 2015-16 year to create the 2016 Opportunity and Achievement Gap Policy. The vision is that “every child, in every classroom, in every school of the Boston Public School system has the same opportunity to achieve the greatness within them as anybody else. Every child has the same unfettered access to every conceivable tool to unlock the greatness within them. And we will know that they have that access because we will witness them achieve that greatness: enrolling and completing college at the same rates as anyone else; breaking into professions and positions of conspicuous influence in the community; and, along the way, reducing to a distant memory the opportunity and achievement gaps that had afflicted every generation before them.”
- The new achievement gap policy holds every district leader, every central office department, every school leader, and every teacher accountable to eliminating achievement gaps and creating opportunities for all.
- Over the summer of 2016, the Superintendent launched a strategic plan that focuses on equity, innovation and coherence. It includes a timeline for bringing the level of cognitive rigor in Advance Work Classes to every student in Boston over the next few years.
- The Superintendent’s priorities are equity, innovation, and coherence, and he keeps equity in the forefront in many ways, evidenced in the statement of his vision.

Using a strategy called World Café, Milton brought together 400 staff members to discuss key questions. These included questions such as “If our district were to win a prize for being Culturally Proficient, what would be in place that would warrant such recognition?” said Vy Vu, Milton’s Data Specialist. During it the staff worked at 60 tables in their field house, responding to the same prompt several times, to dig more deeply into their ideas. The result was rich data about the thoughts, values, and beliefs of their teachers and administrators. “It made a statement that this is important. It was a benefit for K-12 staff to work together on a district

---

priority,” Vy Vu said. “We developed a follow-up survey about what they think should be our priorities.”

In Taunton, Rebecca Couet attributed credit to the superintendent. “Our Superintendent is the reason we are doing all of this work. Cultural Proficiency is one of the seven focus areas connected to the strategic plan, and in 2014, Cultural Proficiency was the Superintendent’s focus for the year,” she said.

PLN members worked to develop culturally proficient systems, such as when they set up policies and initiatives designed to accommodate students and their families. They also worked to develop culturally proficient educators, whose individual work supported their diverse students’ needs and potential.

Where did you begin?

Each of the district teams believe that knowing your community is crucial and drives what you do. The Taunton team reflected that students initially think diversity means skin color, or people that look different. Taunton also includes physical ability, geography, ancestry, age, gender, and sexual orientation as aspects of diversity. They referenced the Lindsey, Nuri-Robins, and Terrell’s (2012) definition of culture: “Culture is defined as all characteristics of human description: age, gender, geography, ancestry, language, history, sexual orientation, faith, physical ability as well as occupation or affiliations” and noted that diversity is often broader than students initially think it is.

Boston engaged central office leaders and school building administrators in professional learning on implicit bias and understanding one’s own frame of reference. They are continuing the bias work along with how to authentically build relationships with students and communities by engaging in practices that validate and support their diverse student population’s historical experiences and present realities.

Providing equitable opportunities and closing the achievement gap have long been priorities for the Milton Public Schools. Milton changed protocols and policies, initially, and implemented tangible changes. For example, they ensured that they had a system for translating materials and providing translation services for home/school communications. In addition, the district infused classroom libraries with literature that both reflected diversity and explored themes such as respecting and celebrating diversity. Milton recognized that their work ahead would involve changes that are harder to see, because cultural proficiency is about beliefs and attitudes as well as protocols and policies.
Who took ownership for this work?

PLN representatives from the three districts described how they worked within existing structures to build on the commitment of educators, community members, and students to do this work.

Milton asked, “What are the structures and the work we already know will happen?” Milton had multiple existing structures that could focus on cultural proficiency: diversity committees at the building level, which were given professional development and opportunities to work with other diversity committees in the district; active site councils at each building; and a Cultural Competence Committee composed of principals and teachers across the elementary, middle, and high schools. Citizens for a Diverse Milton is a self-formed group that comes together to reflect on district goals and initiatives and to attend district events.

Milton extended cultural proficiency work to diverse volunteers, including:
- community liaisons
- family members
- teachers, including teachers of color
- principals
- school-level diversity committees

Milton expanded the dialogue by making sure to have a diverse group of educators, including teachers and administrators of color, and a member of the community. They solicited volunteers and people who had done similar work in the past. Milton then faced the challenge of finding ways to assign leadership roles to the 80 volunteers who requested to be involved.

Boston’s PLN team knew that senior leadership being connected to the work in the very beginning was vital. There was intentionality about how the work fits into the district-wide effort. “It wasn’t pushing into something. It was about supporting the work that the district is focused on,” Ceronne Daly explained.

The Director of Diversity Programs and the Director of Leadership Development co-facilitated the Boston PLN team. The co-facilitators planned each meeting with input and feedback from members. Team members were representative of offices across the district, and during meetings the team considered what might be the best way to move forward. Boston wanted to make sure that their PLN work was part of the district’s comprehensive approach, not an add-on activity. Because senior-level leaders were part of the PLN team, participants left the meetings knowing district-level goals and challenges, and could implement any agreed-upon strategies by starting small with the larger vision in mind.

“Equity means giving people what they need, not equal amounts; it means that there is something some will have to give up and some people will get more.”
- Dr. Colin Rose, Boston’s Asst. Superintendent of the Opportunity and Achievement Gap
In an initial self-assessment session, the Boston equity team mapped equity strategies and designated a strategy lead.

Boston participants explained that the Assistant Superintendent of Equity and the Assistant Superintendent of Opportunity and the Achievement Gap were going to be the keepers and implementers of the work, with the PLN team functioning as thought partners and implementers under the larger vision. The team would continue to meet to press these issues forward and every member considered educational equity a part of their daily work. For instance, one PLN team member decided to focus on race and racism as he planned professional development for his team, and invited additional central office staff to join.

“This work is not easily done, and not something you can give somebody. It is real process work, adaptive change work,” Kris Taylor said.

Taunton reflected that you learn a lot by listening. Hearing from people who see through different lenses informs the equity focus by providing reality checks within the dialogue.

“Teachers that had heard students say their truths in their classrooms gave me ways to contact the students so I could get to know them better and see if they wanted to share their cultural experiences with other teachers. When students spoke about their experiences, it motivated people to see that this work is important. Continuous attention is required so that students feel safe enough to speak their truths. You need to be consistent when working with high school students, and communicate often. I emailed them, text messaged them, fed them food during our meetings, and had one-on-one conversations with them so that they felt comfortable speaking in front of adults,” Rebecca Couet explained.

What were your challenges?

The PLN members identified many challenges, often in the form of questions. These challenges were about defining diversity, having hard conversations, finding time to do the work, redoing the curriculum, planning professional development, improving school climate, and assessing growth in teacher practice and the impact of cultural proficiency on closing the achievement gap.
PLN districts also thought about challenges they faced because of their context. Boston reflected that they are challenged by scale and by their student population: 53,000 students, including 80 percent students who are students of color, over 49 percent who are economically disadvantaged, and 46 percent whose first language is not English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Milton highlighted the complexity of designing professional development for staff who are at different levels of awareness. They are trying to frame the work and affect a shift toward cultural proficiency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston asked: How can we capture when people are thinking differently about their practice? How shall we measure the impact of cultural proficiency strategies on closing the achievement gap?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taunton asked what it means for the staff to be culturally proficient and how to assess this proficiency among staff.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognizing that change takes time, Milton wondered what benchmarks would be visible in classrooms and the district as they worked toward their goal of cultural proficiency and equity.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston said the team will know the impact of their professional development if: the students feel more connected to school; strong partnerships with parents and communities are developed and sustained; there is academic growth; teachers and administrators believe the environment is more inclusive and they feel empowered to be successful with students; attendance is improved; and there are no disparities by race and gender in suspensions and academic achievement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Curriculum</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rethinking the curriculum to make sure that it is culturally sensitive and inclusive can seem like a monumental task. Boston spoke of the need to validate cultures and embed that knowledge in the curriculum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taunton began with classroom mini-lessons, such as modeling how they could include a component of race or gender. A teacher in Taunton used an article and video to model collaborative learning and discussion practices in ELA. Because this was done in September, it connected directly to September 11th, and gave students the opportunity to discuss difficult topics such as Islamophobia. Other colleagues heard about this lesson, and the social studies teacher made connections in his class. Students then felt safe having difficult discussions around diversity and inclusivity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLN districts advocated for defining cultural proficiency beyond the dimensions of race or gender, to include sexuality, role, generation, socio-economic status, learning or physical disabilities, and religion, among others. Boston noted that they want to be talking about any community – however people describe themselves or belong.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Having the Hard Conversations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Talking about the difficult issues requires having hard conversations. PLN districts prompted courageous conversations by asking questions such as: Are we serving all our students and our families? Educational equity for every student has profound implications for a district. Leadership and all other educators need to have courageous conversations to reach a common understanding of what educational equity would mean for students and their families, for themselves, and for their schools and district. Taunton discussed how to deal with micro-aggression, such as a student saying to another student, “You look so beautiful, for a Black girl”? “This work is personal and does force individuals to have hard conversations... The anxiety is palpable. The only way change can happen is to step into the anxiety,” said Dan Anderson of Boston. During Taunton’s Foreign Language Week, students in the Bridge to Employment Program brought up issues they face every day regarding race. The Science Coordinator was moved to ask, “What can we do?” Boston’s Becky Shuster reflected that “this work is not about having an answer or a product. We need to focus on process, collaboration, and engage in sustained conversation about equity.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Professional Development

Boston’s PLN team identified two strategies, and both are predicated on the professional development of principals and teachers:

1. Implement a multiyear cultural proficiency plan in which culturally proficient leaders support the development of culturally proficient teachers-- who create equitable academic learning environments for students-- that leads to increased student achievement and student growth.

2. Improve principal practice through professional learning to improve cultural competency lens, observation and feedback skills, and performance evaluation skills by linking proficient/exemplary practice as it relates to student growth.

This work is not easily done, and not something you can give somebody. It is real process work, adaptive change work.” – Kris Taylor, Boston

Boston has a new organizational structure within the district. Principal leadership and teacher leadership are under the Chief of Schools, to build the capacity of leaders and leadership teams. Going forward, authentic equity practices focus on impacting the school leader and the educators in their schools. For example, the August Leadership Institute had the following objectives:

“Participants will build a community of adult learners committed to the values of equity, coherence, and innovation... better understand individual and collective biases and their impact on our work in eliminating the opportunity and achievement gaps among students...[and] engage in activities that will prepare them to continue building rigorous learning experiences for all students.”

Taunton did a train-the-trainer model in which each lesson for Foreign Language Week was modeled to include cultural inclusiveness. Student leaders conducted these lessons in their classrooms.

A parent in the Milton community is a consultant with a background in cultural proficiency. He has offered some of the professional development. In addition, Milton offered online elementary and secondary courses through Primary Source and 65 educators participated. The Milton District Leadership Team met with Primary Source consultants to discuss the importance of supporting staff in cultivating culturally responsive practices. There is a seven-hour professional development strand for teachers and Milton is considering how cultural proficiency could be a piece of that strand.
What are some things you are working on now?

Taunton’s PLN that is building on the work they did last year, in which they met monthly, read books, and discussed the books to understand where people are coming from and how to start and continue these conversations in schools.

Some Taunton teachers participated in a workshop entitled Understanding and Teaching with Poverty in Mind, presented by Eric Jensen. That session was supported by ESE’s Low income Education Access Project, LEAP. There was a grassroots movement in two schools that embraced Jensen’s work. At every faculty meeting they worked on identifying a strategy for students in poverty. They looked at classroom literature to see if students saw people who looked like them, such as when they were studying inventors. Curriculum development or revision is an important component of the cultural proficiency focus.

Boston is working to make cultural proficiency items on their teacher evaluation rubric and administrator rubric prominent and normed across the district, and is revising their school climate survey to include observables of cultural proficiency.

Milton is working to increase the district’s workforce diversity; they strive to hire teachers that look like the students. In addition, they are continuing calibration work that focuses on cultural proficiency indicators.
## Tools & resources

### Suggested for cultural proficiency work

#### Boston

- Dismantling the School to Prison Pipeline [http://bostonpublicschools.org/dstpp](http://bostonpublicschools.org/dstpp)
- English Language Learners Sub-Committee, Massachusetts Board of Elementary and Secondary Education, "Halting the Race to the Bottom: Urgent Interventions for the Improvement of the Education of English Language Learners in Massachusetts and Selected Districts" (2009). Gastón Institute Publications. Paper 107.

#### Milton


#### Taunton

- What can we do? Taunton Cultural Proficiency Ideas for Your Classroom.
Additional suggestions

- TED Talk – The Dangers of a Single Story by Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie
- http://www.edchange.org
- Like Latinos Beyond Reel.
- Leading by Convening: A Blueprint for Authentic Stakeholder Engagement—IDEA
  The IDEA Partnership reflects the collaborative work of more than 50 national organizations, technical assistance providers, and organizations and agencies at state and local level.