**STEP BACK:** *Where am I starting, and where do I want to go?*

This is an example of how the **Guiding Principle 2 Planning Questions** can be applied to a specific Topic (set of related content standards) from the 2018 Massachusetts History and Social Science Framework*.* It illustrates one possible way these questions might be answered as they relate to this Topic, as well as possible resources to support critical, inclusive, and responsive instruction. Readers should keep in mind that this example was created in consultation with historical experts and resources, and thus reflects greater depth than teachers might initially be able to provide without additional research.

This example should be used in conjunction with the **Guiding Principle 2 Quick Reference Guide**, which provides important context about how these planning questions relate to high-quality history and social science instruction and how they can be used as part of thoughtful unit planning.

**What content is included in this Topic? What prior knowledge and beliefs do students have about this Topic? What narratives was I taught about this topic, and what biases might I have about it?**

**Topic T3.5 at a Glance**

1. Leadership of Pilgrims, Puritans, and Native Peoples
2. Puritan arrival and consequences for Native Peoples
3. Daily life in Massachusetts Bay Colony
4. Role of slavery in American colonies
5. Maritime commerce and bartering economy in Massachusetts

*This topic can be found on p. 56 of the* [*2018 History and Social Science Framework*](https://www.doe.mass.edu/frameworks/hss/2018-12.pdf)*.*

* Focuses on early history of European settlers in Massachusetts and Massachusetts Bay Colony. Common misconceptions based on traditional curricula/popular culture:
  + Students may think the Massachusetts Bay Colony was the same as the colony at Plymouth
  + Students may have stereotypical images of Native Americans and/or believe Native Peoples no longer exist in Massachusetts
* This topic introduces students to slavery for the first time in the curriculum, but students may have a range of familiarity with slavery, depending on exposure outside of school. This may lead to a number of misconceptions about slavery (e.g. not seeing slaves as fully human, conflating slavery and the Civil Rights Movement, etc.).

**How might this Topic present the possibility for problematic messages or** [**curricular violence**](https://www.tolerance.org/magazine/spring-2020/ending-curriculum-violence)**? How and when will I partner with students to learn about their experiences of the curriculum?**

* [Amanda Morris at Teaching Tolerance](https://www.tolerance.org/magazine/planting-truthful-seeds-about-native-americans): Failing to present examples of contemporary Native American culture can lead to ignorance and make students think that native culture is “fair game for misappropriation, disrespect, and abuse”
* Ignoring negative repercussions of Europeans’ arrival on Native Americans can send message that the loss of land and life was justifiable or unimportant
* Failing to introduce students to the realities of slavery now—when they first begin studying early America—can make it harder for them to accept this aspect of American history later on. At the same time, this discussion must be age-appropriate, and balanced with narratives of empowerment in order to avoid a narrative of victimization
* Simulations and reenactments of interactions between Native Peoples and Europeans, or of the experiences of enslaved people, are harmful; they can either whitewash historical oppression or lead to curricular violence

**What is my goal in teaching this Topic? What do I want students to learn about themselves, the past, and the world? What essential questions, skills, knowledge, and enduring understandings are at the heart of this Topic?**

* Introduce an honest and complex story about early Massachusetts and the various groups of people who shaped its development over time
* Understand how different groups of people experienced history differently; begin to see how identity and social status (race, ethnicity, class, gender) affected people’s lives in the Massachusetts Bay Colony, and play a role in people’s experiences of historical events more generally
* Discussion of the economic and cultural changes during this time can be grounded in a study of local community, deepening students’ understanding of the place they live

**REFLECT, RECONSIDER, AND PLAN:** *What is my current practice, and what would I like to do differently to be more inclusive, critical, and responsive?*

|  |
| --- |
| **INCLUSIVE**  ***My instruction should incorporate and center a diversity of historical perspectives, voices, and narratives.*** |
| **Reflect:** What is the dominant narrative about this Topic? Whose voices and experiences are typically centered? |
| * Dominant narrative places (male) Europeans at the center (e.g., use of the name “King Philip” rather than “Metacom” illustrates centering of European frame) * Traditional story is of Pilgrims and Puritans migrating to a nation that was essentially a wilderness, with “uncivilized” Native Americans inhabiting the land but not making use of it; European settlements like the Massachusetts Bay Colony improved the land and built up economy where none existed * Native Americans often portrayed monolithically, as a threat to or harmoniously coexisting with Europeans |
| **Reconsider:** What and who is marginalized or missing in that narrative? Whose voices should be included to tell a more holistic and complete story? |
| * Existing, displaced native societies are often marginalized; in 3.T5.1, could do an in-depth study of [Wampanoag sovereignty](https://www.socialstudies.org/system/files/publications/articles/yl_3101012.pdf) * In 3.T5.2, [maps](https://collections.leventhalmap.org/search/commonwealth:7h149w677) of native nations can challenge narrative that the country was essentially empty when Europeans arrived * When discussing daily life in the Massachusetts Bay Colony in 3.T5.3, experiences of women, indentured servants, and enslaved people should be examined alongside those of male leaders; their experiences of colonial life were very different than that of the religious and political elite, and their labor was essential to the colony’s functioning |
| **Plan**: What instructional approaches can I use to foster student engagement with these voices and experiences? How will I ensure these voices and perspectives are included equitably, not marginalized? |
| * Use trade books to establish humanity of indigenous and African people before introducing idea of enslavement (e.g., [*Bowwow Powwow*](https://socialjusticebooks.org/bowwow-powwow/), *[The People Shall Continue](https://socialjusticebooks.org/people-shall-continue/)*) or introduce students to the Wampanoag experience of European arrival (e.g., [*Barnicle and Husk*](https://www.barnicleandhusk.com/)) * Use video clips from [*Our Story: 400 Years of Wampanoag History*](https://www.plymouth400inc.org/our-story-exhibit-wampanoag-history/), [images and excerpts about Native American agricultural practices and foods](https://americanindian.si.edu/sites/1/files/pdf/education/thanksgiving_poster.pdf),or the [*Massachusetts Chronicles* reading on Wampanoag New Year observances](https://www.bridgew.edu/sites/bridgew/files/2020-07/NEW-YEAR-PREPARATIONS-UNDERWAY.pdf), to present students with accurate images of indigenous life and introduce the history through an indigenous lens * Focus lessons on enduring understandings that explicitly challenge stereotypes—Museum of the American Indian has a [Framework for Essential Understandings about American Indians](https://americanindian.si.edu/nk360/pdf/NMAI-Essential-Understandings.pdf) that can guide this work * Explicitly compare and contrast how perspectives shape people’s understanding of the past, such as in comparing explanations for of King Philip’s War in 3.T5.1 (see 3rd Grade Lesson 3-8 from [Open Social Studies](http://www.opensocialstudies.org/K-6.html)) or by comparing perspectives in newspaper-style articles from the *Massachusetts Chronicles* (e.g. [Puritan perspective on the founding of Boston](https://www.bridgew.edu/sites/bridgew/files/2020-07/Birth-of-Boston.pdf) compared to [indigenous perspective on efforts to spread Christianity](https://www.bridgew.edu/sites/bridgew/files/2020-07/English-intensify-efforts-to-convert.pdf)) |

|  |
| --- |
| **CRITICAL**  ***My instruction should challenge students to consider how identity and social position shape people’s perceptions of events, and encourage honest and informed discussions about power, prejudice, and oppression.*** |
| **Reflect:** Where and how is the role of identity and social position (race, gender, sexual orientation, class, etc.) typically addressed in this Topic, if at all? |
| * Race typically addressed to some extent when talking about slavery: students are aware that Black Africans were enslaved by white Europeans, even if the role of race and racism is not explicitly named * Gender roles among the Puritans usually come up in somewhat broad strokes (discussion of how traditional values and strict beliefs meant that women were subordinate in public life) |
| **Reconsider:** How else did people’s intersecting identities and social position shape their experiences within this Topic? Where was prejudice and oppression present, and how was it reinforced or challenged? |
| * Europeans used racist stereotypes and [beliefs](https://upstanderproject.org/firstlight/doctrine), alongside [legal structures](https://www.massmoments.org/moment-details/first-slaves-arrive-in-massachusetts.html), to justify and support enslavement and displacement * King Phillip’s War in 3.T5.2 is example of both oppression ([many Native Americans were enslaved in the aftermath](https://www.brown.edu/news/2017-02-15/enslavement)) and resistance ([Weetamoo](https://www.amherst.edu/news/news_releases/2018/4-2018/re-thinking-king-philip-s-war) was a female leader who took an active role in helping protect her people during war) * In 3.T5.3, examine European dissenters who challenged oppression within the colony; e.g., [Anne Hutchinson](https://www.massmoments.org/moment-details/anne-hutchinson-banished.html), who spread ideas contrary to Puritan gender roles, and was ultimately exiled * When discussing slavery in the 17th and 18th centuries (3.T5.4), disrupt narratives of victimization by describing examples of resistors like [Elizabeth Freeman](https://www.wbur.org/news/2020/01/27/elizabeth-freeman-sheffield-slave-ashley-sedgwick), or examine the way that enslaved people maintained their culture and developed new traditions like [spirituals](https://www.pbs.org/wnet/religionandethics/2012/05/04/may-4-2012-african-american-spirituals/10896/) |
| **Plan:** What instructional approaches will empower students to engage in meaningful and [brave](https://www.facinghistory.org/resource-library/back-school-2020-building-community-connection-and-learning/activities-remote-hybrid-start/brave-spaces) conversations about identity, power, oppression, and resistance within this Topic? |
| * Teaching Tolerance’s [Teaching Hard History guide](https://www.tolerance.org/sites/default/files/2020-08/TT-2007-Teaching-Hard-History-K-5-Framework.pdf) lays out strategies for teaching about enslavement in grades 3-5:   + Being ready to talk about race   + Teaching about cultural commonalities students might have with enslaved people   + Focusing on the history and stories of enslaved people beyond slavery   + Embedding opportunities to discuss civic concepts like power, authority, and activism   + Teaching about conflict and change * They suggest that using accessible texts like [*The Kidnapped Prince*](https://www.penguinrandomhouse.com/books/23179/the-kidnapped-prince-by-by-olaudah-equiano-adapted-by-ann-cameron/) can be a grade-appropriate way of introducing an honest discussion of the treatment of enslaved people * Explicitly talking about race and racial prejudice as it relates to both enslavement and displacement of Native Americans through activities like “[paper plate portraits](https://www.tolerance.org/classroom-resources/tolerance-lessons/understanding-prejudice-through-paper-plate-portraits)” to help students reflect on prejudice and stereotypes * Using [language](https://naacpculpeper.org/resources/writing-about-slavery-this-might-help/) carefully and thoughtfully (e.g., “enslaved person” rather than “slave” centers humanity of people who were enslaved as well as acknowledges oppressive acts at the heart of slavery) |
| **RESPONSIVE**  ***My instruction should offer all students opportunities to connect their multiple identities and experiences to their study of the past.*** |
| **Reflect:** Do my students typically see their identities reflected in this Topic? If so, which students and how? |
| * Given that this topic centers on Massachusetts, some students (white, indigenous, or Black) may be able to trace their family’s history in Massachusetts to the time period under study, and may feel a particular connection to the topic * Since race is an important part of this topic, students of white, indigenous, and Black heritage will be aware of how their racial identity is represented in this Topic; thus, important to make sure all groups presented in a way that challenges stereotypes and emphasizes their agency * Easy for a focus on enslavement to lead to a dominant narrative of victimization and oppression about Black Americans, rather than lending them voice and humanity |
| **Reconsider:** What other opportunities does this Topic present for my students to see their multiple identities reflected in the Topic, or explore aspects of their identities more deeply? |
| * As students learn about the economic history of colonial Massachusetts, topic 3.T5.5 urges them to use materials from historical societies and museums—chance to deepen understanding of place and further knowledge of their local community * Students could research [the native territory that their community is located in](https://native-land.ca/) and see what publicly available resources that nation has about its history, using that information alongside material from other historical societies and museums |
| **Plan:** What instructional approaches can I use while teaching this Topic to provide students with opportunities to make connections to their own identities and experiences? |
| * A central theme throughout Topic is that of community and place: What values, traditions, and beliefs united people in indigenous, colonial, or enslaved communities? As students learn about the ways in which each of these communities had their own robust cultures—and [efforts to maintain these cultures in the modern day](https://www.bridgew.edu/sites/bridgew/files/2020-07/EXPERT-TO-REVIVE-NATIVE-LANGUAGE.pdf)—they can find points of commonality with their own culture and values * Students could write a [land acknowledgement](https://nativegov.org/a-guide-to-indigenous-land-acknowledgment/) for their school or community as a way of taking action and connecting their learning to their understanding of place and local history |

*Reference in this website to any specific commercial products, processes, or services, or the use of any trade, firm, or corporation name is for the information and convenience of the public, and does not constitute endorsement or recommendation by the Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (DESE). Our office is not responsible for and does not in any way guarantee the accuracy of information in other sites accessible through links herein. For more information contact:* [*historycivics@doe.mass.edu*](mailto:historycivics@doe.mass.edu)