|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ESE logo | |
|  | Report to the Legislature:  Commonwealth Virtual Schools – Fiscal Year 2017 |
|  |
| This report provides information on the implementation and impact of virtual schools pursuant to G.L. c. 71 §94(p).  September 2018 |
| Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education  75 Pleasant Street, Malden, MA 02148-4906  Phone 781-338-3000TTY: N.E.T. Relay 800-439-2370  www.doe.mass.edu |
| |  | | --- | | ESE logo  This document was prepared by the  Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education  Jeffrey C. Riley  Commissioner    **Board of Elementary and Secondary Education Members**  Mr. Paul Sagan, Chair, Cambridge  Ms. Katherine Craven, Brookline  Mr. Edward Doherty, Hyde Park  Ms. Amanda Fernández, Belmont  Ms. Maya Mathews, Student Advisory Council, Newton  Ms. Margaret McKenna, Boston  Mr. Michael Moriarty, Holyoke  Mr. James Morton, Vice Chair, Springfield  Mr. James Peyser, Secretary of Education, Milton  Ms. Mary Ann Stewart, Lexington  Dr. Martin West, Newton  Jeffrey C. Riley, Commissioner  Secretary to the Board  The Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, an affirmative action employer, is committed to ensuring that all of its programs and facilities are accessible to all members of the public.  We do not discriminate on the basis of age, color, disability, national origin, race, religion, sex, gender identity, or sexual orientation.  Inquiries regarding the Department’s compliance with Title IX and other civil rights laws may be directed to the  Human Resources Director, 75 Pleasant St., Malden, MA 02148-4906. Phone: 781-338-6105.  © 2018 Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education  Permission is hereby granted to copy any or all parts of this document for non-commercial educational purposes. Please credit the “Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education.”  This document printed on recycled paper  Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education  75 Pleasant Street, Malden, MA 02148-4906  Phone 781-338-3000 TTY: N.E.T. Relay 800-439-2370  www.doe.mass.edu  State Seal of Massachusetts | | | |

*****Massachusetts Department of***

***Elementary & Secondary Education***

*75 Pleasant Street, Malden, Massachusetts 02148-4906 Telephone: (781) 338-3000*

*TTY: N.E.T. Relay 1-800-439-2370*

| Jeffrey C. Riley  *Commissioner* |  |
| --- | --- |

September 11, 2018

Dear Members of the General Court:

I am pleased to submit this Report to the Legislature: Commonwealth Virtual Schools, pursuant to G.L. c. 71, § 94(p).

A Commonwealth Virtual School (CMVS) is a public school operated by a board of trustees whose teachers primarily teach from a remote location using the Internet or other computer-based methods and whose students are not required to be located at the physical premises of the school. Like a charter school, a virtual school is an autonomous, single-school district that operates independently of any existing school district.

The Board of Elementary and Secondary Education (Board) grants a certificate to the board of trustees of a virtual school for not less than 3 years and not more than 5 years, as determined by the Board. The school and its board then become a state entity, directly accountable to the Board and the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education (Department). A virtual school may not discriminate in the enrollment of students based on race, color, national origin, creed, sex, gender identity, ethnicity, sexual orientation, mental or physical disability, age, ancestry, athletic performance, special need, English language proficiency, or academic achievement.

The Board has granted two virtual school certificates, one to the Greenfield Commonwealth Virtual School (GCVS) and one to the TEC Connections Academy Commonwealth Virtual School (TECCA). Both schools enroll students statewide. These schools enrolled a total of 1,786 students as of October 1, 2016 (FY17, the period addressed in this report).

If you have any questions about this report, please contact Senior Associate Commissioner Cliff W. Chuang at 781-338-3222.

Sincerely,

Jeffrey C. Riley

Commissioner of Elementary and Secondary Education

Table of Contents

[Introduction 5](#_Toc505781928)

[Greenfield Commonwealth Virtual School 5](#_Toc505781929)

[TEC Connections Academy Commonwealth Virtual School 7](#_Toc505781930)

[Fiscal Impact on Sending Districts 7](#_Toc505781931)

[Course Completion and Student Attendance and Participation Rates 8](#_Toc505781932)

[Enrollment Trends, Limits and Wait Lists 10](#_Toc505781933)

[Academic Achievement 11](#_Toc505781934)

[Supervision and Support for Students in Elementary and Middle School 11](#_Toc505781935)

[Support for Online Course Completion 12](#_Toc505781936)

[Professional Development 12](#_Toc505781937)

[Recommended Changes to the Commonwealth Virtual School Program 12](#_Toc505781938)

[Appendix A: Commonwealth Virtual Schools (G.L. c. 71 §94) 15](#_Toc505781939)

[Appendix B: CMVS Tuition by District of Residence, FY17 22](#_Toc505781940)

[Appendix C: Academic Achievement Data 29](#_Toc505781941)

# Introduction

The Department of Elementary and Secondary Education respectfully submits this Report to the Legislature: Commonwealth Virtual Schools pursuant to G.L. c. 71 § 94(p):

*“On or before September 1, the commissioner shall prepare a report on the implementation and impact of this section, including, but not limited to:(1) the fiscal impact on sending districts; (2) any necessary adjustments to tuition rates, including whether the amount should vary based on grade or type of school and the appropriate mechanism for funding virtual schools; (3) information on course completion and student attendance and participation rates; (4) the academic achievement of students attending commonwealth virtual schools; (5) the level of supervision or support needed for students in elementary and middle school; (6) the support necessary or helpful to ensure that students successfully complete online courses; (7) the professional development virtual school teachers require; (8) the appropriate enrollment limit for a virtual school, if any, including information about wait lists; and (9) the need for any changes to the commonwealth virtual school program.”*

A Commonwealth Virtual School (CMVS) is a public school operated by a board of trustees where Massachusetts-licensed teachers primarily teach from a remote location using the Internet or other computer-based methods, and where students are not required to be located at the physical premises of the school. The statute permits up to ten virtual schools to operate in the Commonwealth at any time: three virtual schools were allowed to operate during the 2013-2016 school years; three additional certificates will be available from 2016-19; and four additional certificates will be available starting in 2020.

As of this writing, the Board of Elementary and Secondary Education (Board) has granted two virtual school certificates, one to the Greenfield Commonwealth Virtual School (GCVS) and one to the TEC Connections Academy Commonwealth Virtual School (TECCA). [[1]](#footnote-1) Both schools enroll students statewide. As of October 1, 2016, these schools enrolled a total of 1,786 students (FY17, the period addressed in this report).

# Greenfield Commonwealth Virtual School

The Greenfield Commonwealth Virtual School (GCVS), formerly known as Massachusetts Virtual Academy of Greenfield (MAVA), opened in 2010 under the innovation school law (G.L. c. 71, § 92) as a Greenfield Public School. On June 25, 2013, the Board granted a three-year certificate to operate the re-named Massachusetts Virtual Academy at Greenfield Commonwealth Virtual School (GCVS) to a Board of Trustees (GCVS Board) formed to assume governance of MAVA from the Greenfield Public Schools. Educational courses and teaching services, including management software, learning materials, and technical support services were provided by K12, Inc. (K12) – a virtual school provider based in Herndon, Virginia.

On June 5, 2014, the Department conducted an accountability review of GCVS in accordance with CMR 52.08. The report documented concerns about the school’s faithfulness to its certificate, the quality of the academic program, the quality and amount of supports for diverse learners, and the school's lack of compliance with regulatory requirements and the Department’s guidance. Due to these concerns, on October 20, 2014, pursuant to the virtual school regulations with 603 CMR 52.12(2) and on the recommendation of the Commissioner, the Board placed GCVS on probation for the remainder of its certificate term, which expired on June 30, 2016.

The Department conducted a second review of GCVS on March 2, 2015. The report indicated that GCVS made progress toward meeting the terms of its probation and noted that the GCVS Board and school leadership took affirmative steps to improve instruction and professional learning. However, the review identified a dependency on teacher-developed materials to ensure curriculum alignment, the lack of a formal curriculum for English learner (EL) students, the lack of a formal inclusion model for students with disabilities, variation in the execution of the school’s expectations for teaching higher order thinking skills, and uneven instruction. In a June 29, 2015 response to the review, GCVS described the additional steps it planned to take to address these concerns, including researching EL curricula for the fall of 2015 and how, in the estimation of school leadership, online interventions presented a clear picture of the performance of students who were experiencing academic difficulties.

The school’s certificate expired at the end of the 2015-2016 school year. Pursuant to CMR 52.11, and in accordance with the Department’s guidelines, on June 28, 2015, GCVS applied to renew its certificate. The Department conducted a renewal inspection in November 2015; the report from this inspection was issued to the school on December 14, 2015. As previously noted, at its February 23, 2016 meeting, in accordance with G.L. c. 71, §94, and 603 CMR 52.00, the Board renewed the certificate of GCVS for an additional three-year period from July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2019 with a maximum enrollment of 750 students. Further, pursuant to 603 CMR 52.12(2), the Board extended the school’s probationary status and directed it to meet specified terms of probation, as recommended by former Commissioner Chester in his memorandum to the Board dated February 12, 2016.

Since it opened as MAVA in 2010, the school’s educational courses and teaching services, including management software, learning materials, and technical support services, were provided by K12. At its May 22, 2017 meeting, the GCVS board of trustees voted to formally terminate the school’s contract with K12, effective June 30, 2017. The reasons given for the change were concerns about the affordability of K12’s products and services, and the opportunity for GCVS to provide more flexible learning options for students through new software and curriculum. In addition, the cost savings would enable the school to hire additional teachers.

GCVS submitted a formal request to amend its certificate on June 8, 2017. After careful review by Department staff, the Commissioner approved these amendments on October 19, 2017. The request included the following key changes to the school’s education program and operations:

* A new learning management system (Canvas by Instructure, Inc.) that enables teachers, parents/guardians, and students to access the curriculum from any computer, tablet, or mobile device.
* EngageNY as the core curriculum for grades K-5 English Language Arts (ELA) and mathematics. The school’s social studies and science curriculum will be curated from EngageNY, National Geographic, PBS, and other sources.
* Florida Virtual School Global (FLVS) as the core curriculum for all subjects in grades 6-12.
* The hiring of approximately 10 additional staff members, including classroom teachers, special educators, and visual arts, music, health/wellness, and world language teachers.
* Technical support for students, parents/guardians, and staff will be provided by an in-house technology support team.

# TEC Connections Academy Commonwealth Virtual School

On February 25, 2014, the Board granted a three-year certificate to the board of trustees of the TEC Connections Academy Commonwealth Virtual School (TECCA).[[2]](#footnote-2) TECCA opened in the fall of 2014.

The Department conducted an accountability review of TECCA on February 24, 2016 and a renewal inspection review on November 3, 2016. While both reports found that TECCA delivered an instructional program consistent with its certificate, the renewal inspection noted that TECCA had been classified into Level 3 of the state's accountability and assistance system for very low MCAS participation (less than 90%) in the aggregate and for multiple subgroups. The review also found that TECCA lacked an English language education curriculum to support its growing English learner (EL) population.

On February 17, 2017, the Board voted to renew the certificate for TECCA for an additional five years and place conditions on the school’s certificate to address the concerns related to student participation in MCAS tests and supports for ELs. In recommending that the Board renew the certificate for TECCA for an additional five years, rather than the minimum of three years, then Commissioner Chester gave the school the opportunity to build on its early gains and demonstrate a solid track record of performance.

# Fiscal Impact on Sending Districts

The virtual school statute, at G.L. c. 71, § 94(k), funds a CMVS based upon the funding for school choice under G.L. c. 76, § 12B: the school district of residence of each student enrolled in the CMVS is charged a set tuition, and the Department transfers the funds from the district to the CMVS. Tuition is based on full year enrollment and is prorated if a student is enrolled in the CMVS for only a portion of the school year.

The default tuition rate for a student enrolled in a CVMS is the school choice tuition rate of $5,000.[[3]](#footnote-3) The Board, in consultation with the Operational Services Division (OSD), may approve a rate higher than $5,000 in CMVS certificates provided the rate does not exceed the state average per pupil foundation budget for students of the same classification and grade level. G.L. c. 71, § 94(k); 603 CMR 52.07(1). The state average per pupil foundation budget is $10,774. GCVS and TECCA currently receive a per pupil tuition amount of $6,700, less $75 per pupil retained by the Department for program administration, as permitted by statute ($6,625).[[4]](#footnote-4)

In FY17, the virtual schools received $13,397,669 in tuition payments from 233 districts of residence. While enrollment varies from district to district, the following six districts accounted for approximately 22 percent of virtual school tuition and enrollment: Springfield (7 percent), Boston (6 percent), Worcester (3 percent), New Bedford (3 percent), Fall River (2 percent), and Lowell (2 percent). A summary of FY17 tuition payments is provided in Appendix B.

# Course Completion and Student Attendance and Participation Rates

GCVS and TECCA provide 425 instructional hours in kindergarten, 900 hours in grades 1-8, and 990 hours in grades 9-12 in accordance with state regulations.

Both schools offer flexibility in terms of the time of day when students participate. Teachers and “learning coaches” (students’ parents/guardians) take daily attendance and monitor the hours of schoolwork completed. In FY17, GCVS reported an attendance rate of 86.2 percent and TECCA reported an attendance rate of 89.4 percent.

While each school’s calendar provides for holidays and vacations during which teachers are not available, students may continue to do schoolwork and access the online learning management system at any time during the school year. Attendance is based on courses completion and not “seat time” – while each school expects all students to complete their coursework by the end of a typical semester or school year, students may proceed through the curriculum at their own pace.

Course completion data for TECCA are provided in Table 1.[[5]](#footnote-5) Because many students arrive in school after the beginning of the school year or transferred out of the school prior to the end of the school year, course completion data are only reported for students enrolled in the schools for a full academic year, as defined in Table 1 below. In addition, comparisons of 2016 and 2017 course completion and pass rates are provided in Table 2 for TECCA.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Table 1: FY17 Course Completion Data, TECCA** | | | | | | | | | |
| **Grade** | | **A.** | | **B.** | **C.** | **D.** | **E.** | **F.** | **G.** |
| **Enrollment** | | **Courses Attempted** | **Courses Incomplete** | **Courses Completed** | **Courses Completed (%)** | **Courses Passed** | **Courses Passed (%)** |
| **K** | | 17 | | 206 | 2 | 204 | 99.0% | 186 | 91.2% |
| **1** | | 21 | | 254 | 0 | 254 | 100.0% | 231 | 90.9% |
| **2** | | 25 | | 303 | 2 | 301 | 99.3% | 264 | 87.7% |
| **3** | | 30 | | 369 | 1 | 368 | 99.7% | 328 | 89.1% |
| **4** | | 21 | | 253 | 4 | 249 | 98.4% | 206 | 82.7% |
| **5** | | 29 | | 648 | 4 | 644 | 99.4% | 541 | 84.0% |
| **6** | | 57 | | 853 | 5 | 848 | 99.4% | 658 | 77.6% |
| **7** | | 79 | | 1502 | 31 | 1471 | 97.9% | 1121 | 76.2% |
| **8** | | 100 | | 1512 | 32 | 1480 | 97.9% | 1114 | 75.3% |
| **9** | | 111 | | 1752 | 126 | 1626 | 92.8% | 1030 | 63.3% |
| **10** | | 123 | | 1840 | 100 | 1740 | 94.6% | 1252 | 72.0% |
| **11** | | 101 | | 1395 | 127 | 1268 | 90.9% | 1106 | 87.2% |
| **12** | | 106 | | 1427 | 137 | 1290 | 90.4% | 1077 | 83.5% |
| **Totals** | | **820** | | **12314** | **571** | **11743** | **95.4%** | **9114** | **77.6%** |
| **Legend** | | | | | | | | | |
| **A** | Enrollment | | Students enrolled in the CMVS as of October 1 of the prior school year, excluding transfers out and transfers in after October 1. | | | | | | |
| **B** | Courses Attempted | | Courses in which the students in Column A were enrolled during the school year (full-year and semester-based courses). | | | | | | |
| **C** | Courses Incomplete | | Courses from which students withdrew, regardless of the grade they earned in the course at the time of course wit­­­­­hdrawal. | | | | | | |
| **D** | Courses Completed | | Courses completed by students, regardless of the grade they earned in the course. | | | | | | |
| **E** | Courses Completed (%) | | Column D (Courses Completed) ÷ Column B (Courses Attempted) | | | | | | |
| **F** | Courses Passed | | Courses completed by students in which they earned a passing grade. | | | | | | |
| **G** | Courses Passed (%) | | Column F (Courses passed) ÷ Column D (Courses Completed) | | | | | | |

| Table 2: FY16 – FY17 Percentage Point Change in Course Completion and Pass Rates - TECCA | | | | | | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Grade | FY16 Courses completed (%) | FY16 Courses passed (%) | FY17 Courses completed (%) | FY17 Courses passed (%) | FY16-FY17 Change in Courses Completed | FY16-FY17 Change in Courses Passed |
| K | 88% | 99.6% | 99.0% | 91.2% | 11.0% | -8.4% |
| 1 | 85% | 84.2% | 100.0% | 90.9% | 15.0% | 6.7% |
| 2 | 74% | 86.3% | 99.3% | 87.7% | 25.3% | 1.4% |
| 3 | 72% | 90.9% | 99.7% | 89.1% | 27.7% | -1.8% |
| 4 | 85% | 91.0% | 98.4% | 82.7% | 13.4% | -8.3% |
| 5 | 91% | 87.6% | 99.4% | 84.0% | 8.4% | -3.6% |
| 6 | 80% | 72.4% | 99.4% | 77.6% | 19.4% | 5.2% |
| 7 | 82% | 83.3% | 97.9% | 76.2% | 15.9% | -7.1% |
| 8 | 88% | 83.3% | 97.9% | 75.3% | 9.9% | -8.0% |
| 9 | 83% | 56.8% | 92.8% | 63.3% | 9.8% | 6.5% |
| 10 | 79% | 77.2% | 94.6% | 72.0% | 15.6% | -5.2% |
| 11 | 87% | 83.6% | 90.9% | 87.2% | 3.9% | 3.6% |
| 12 | 90% | 91.6% | 90.4% | 83.5% | 0.4% | -8.1% |
| All | 84% | 78.9% | 95.4% | 77.6% | 11.4% | -1.3% |

# Enrollment Trends, Limits and Wait Lists

The statute caps the total number of full-time students attending virtual schools at two percent of the total number of students attending all public schools in the Commonwealth. In FY17, 953,748 students attended public schools in the Commonwealth, of which .19 percent, or 1,786 students, were enrolled in a CMVS.

| **School Year** | **Statewide Enrollment** | **CMVS Enrollment** | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **#** | **%** |
| 2013-14 | 955,739 | 454 | 0.05 |
| 2014-15 | 955,844 | 1,087 | 0.11 |
| 2015-16 | 953,429 | 1,429 | 0.15 |
| 2016-17 | 953,748 | 1,786 | 0.19 |
| 2017-18 | 954,034 | 2,123 | 0.22 |

As shown in the graph below, GCVS and TECCA enroll higher percentages of economically disadvantaged students, high need students, and students with disabilities, and lower percentages of Els and non-native English speakers.[[6]](#footnote-6)

According to the enrollment policies of both schools, eligibility for enrollment in a specific grade requires a student to have successfully completed the preceding grade. Each school reviews academic documentation to ensure accurate grade level assignments and course placements.

Neither GCVS nor TECCA reported a waitlist as of November 2017.

# Academic Achievement

GCVS and TECCA administered “next generation” MCAS tests in spring 2017 in grades 3-8 in English language arts (ELA) and mathematics, respectively. The schools administered legacy MCAS tests in ELA and math in grade 10 and the science, technology, and engineering (STE) test in grades 5, 8, and 10. A summary of student performance data for both schools is provided in Appendix C.

# Supervision and Support for Students in Elementary and Middle School

Much of the responsibility for student learning is placed on the “learning coach,” typically the student’s parent/guardian, particularly in the early grades. Learning coaches facilitate their student’s progress through daily lessons and help manage the student’s schedule and pacing through the online program. Both schools have systems in place for closely monitoring student progress on a course-by-course basis.

At GCVS, guidance counselors and family engagement coordinators help learning coaches and students adjust to the virtual environment, support students’ nonacademic needs, and create a sense of community through face-to-face and virtual activities. Learning coaches interviewed by Department staff said they were pleased with the efforts GCVS is making to create a community and encourage contact with other learning coaches through face-to-face meetings and committee opportunities.

# Support for Online Course Completion

At GCVS and TECCA, a “learning coach,” typically the student’s parent/guardian, facilitates student progress through daily lessons, with flexibility in terms of pace and scheduling. The schools expect learning coaches to spend three to five hours daily supporting students and students to spend five to six hours daily on schoolwork and homework. Teachers are expected to manage all facets of the student’s instructional experience and engage in regular communication with learning coaches and students via e-mail, telephone, and online meetings. Further, both schools arrange face-to-face activities, such as field trips, throughout the school year.

# Professional Development

GCVS teachers receive three weeks of professional development in the summer before the school year. In addition, the calendar provides for three “work days” in November, January, and April. Topics for 2017 included the educator evaluation system, curriculum mapping, and work time for report cards. In addition, new teachers, or teachers new to GCVS, receive support via monthly meetings with a mentor.

At TECCA, teachers receive professional development one day per week. The content is coordinated by school leadership and implemented by various staff with particular expertise. In 2017, topics included online lesson training, creating and monitoring message boards, teaching higher order thinking skills, understanding the truancy process and Child Find, and using data to inform instruction. New teachers generally meet with their supervisors on a weekly basis and are part of a new teacher group that meets monthly. In addition, TECCA offers a career ladder system that provides stipends to teachers who aspire to leadership positions in the school, in exchange for working on important projects.

# Recommended Changes to the Commonwealth Virtual School Program

Given the mixed performance of virtual schools in Massachusetts as well as nationally, the Department has encouraged GCVS and TECCA to refine their programs to increase the effectiveness of virtual education.

Between November 18, 2015, and October 14, 2016, the Digital Learning Advisory Council (DLAC) heard presentations from GCVS and TECCA regarding funding. Both schools were invited to comment on the adequacy of the current rate and explain how they would use a tuition increase to better meet the needs of their students.[[7]](#footnote-7) Both schools indicated that their current tuition rates are not adequate to serve the needs of the students they enroll.

The schools proposed using additional tuition to meet the needs of their students and to enhance recruitment and retention of educators who possess the specialized knowledge and skill to work with these student populations, and both schools proposed hiring additional staff to decrease student load and increase contact time with students.[[8]](#footnote-8) For example, TECCA would hire additional staff to provide individualized services to students; and GCVS would hire additional teachers. Both schools also proposed increasing starting teacher salaries and phasing in salary increases to be more competitive with other districts.[[9]](#footnote-9)

While many variables affect the relative costs of online schools and traditional schooling, GCVS and TECCA report serving student populations with atypical needs as compared to students enrolled in traditional school districts and charter schools. In granting a certificate to operate a virtual school, the virtual schools statute requires the Board to give preference to proposals that include an educational program or a specialized focus that appropriately addresses students with unique needs.G.L. c. 71, § 94(c).

Compared to state averages, students enrolled in virtual schools in Massachusetts are more likely to have had a history of high mobility and lower achievement than students enrolled in brick-and-mortar schools. Virtual school students are more likely to have lower attendance rates and to have been suspended from school or repeated a grade. Students enrolling in virtual schools are significantly more likely to be economically disadvantaged. Finally, the percentage of students with disabilities enrolled in a CMVS is growing faster than the state average. [[10]](#footnote-10)[[11]](#footnote-11)

The Board set the current rate of $6,700 based on a review of national studies available in 2012.[[12]](#footnote-12) Our experience since 2012 is that they are held accountable for the same outcomes as brick-and-mortar schools, but for more complex student populations and with fewer resources.[[13]](#footnote-13) This holds true even when the costs attributed to the Commonwealth’s brick-and-mortar schools, such as operations and maintenance, are omitted.[[14]](#footnote-14)

After consideration of each school’s request and the various factors outlined above, the Board voted on December 19, 2017 to amend the certificates of the two virtual schools to specify $8,190 in per pupil tuition, effective for FY19, and authorize the Department to adjust this rate annually for inflation.[[15]](#footnote-15)

While increased funding does not guarantee improved outcomes, providing these schools with resources to further innovate on the model, coupled with strong oversight, will in time confirm whether full-time virtual schooling can become a viable and effective option for the Commonwealth’s students and families.

# Appendix A: Commonwealth Virtual Schools (G.L. c. 71 §94)

Section 94. (a) As used in this section the following words shall, unless the context clearly requires otherwise, have the following meanings:—

“Board,” the board of elementary and secondary education.

“Commissioner”, the commissioner of elementary and secondary education.

“Commonwealth virtual school”, a public school operated by a board of trustees whose teachers primarily teach from a remote location using the internet or other computer-based methods and whose students are not required to be located at the physical premises of the school.

“Certificate”, a certificate of organization issued by the board to a commonwealth virtual school’s board of trustees which governs the operations of the commonwealth virtual school.

“Department”, the department of elementary and secondary education.

“District” or “school district”, the school department of a city, town, regional school district or county agricultural school.

“Education collaborative,” an association of 2 or more school committees or boards of trustees of charter schools established pursuant to section 4E of chapter 40.

(b) On or before October 1, the board shall issue a request for proposals to establish 1 or more commonwealth virtual schools; provided, however, that the board shall not be required to issue a request for proposals for any school year for which a certificate is not available to be awarded. The request for proposals shall be published on the department’s website. Persons or entities eligible to submit a proposal to establish a commonwealth virtual school shall include, but not be limited to: (i) a school district; (ii) 2 or more school districts; (iii) an education collaborative; (iv) an institution of higher education; (v) a non-profit entity; (vi) 2 or more certified teachers; or (vii) parents. Private and parochial schools and for-profit entities shall not be eligible to submit a proposal. A proposal shall be selected from the responses to the request for proposals and an applicant awarded a certificate under the procedures adopted by the board. The request for proposals shall include, but not be limited to, the following terms and conditions that shall be addressed in each response to the request for proposals and, upon selection by the board, shall be incorporated into the certificate to operate a commonwealth virtual school:

(1) the mission, purpose and specialized focus, if any, of the proposed commonwealth virtual school;

(2) the educational program, instructional methodology and services to be offered to students;

(3) the organization of the school by ages of students or grades to be taught and an estimate of the total enrollment of the commonwealth virtual school;

(4) the method for and timetable of admission to the commonwealth virtual school;

(5) the commonwealth virtual school governance and by-laws;

(6) the proposed school year;

(7) how the commonwealth virtual school shall administer state required assessment tests;

(8) a statement of equal educational opportunity which shall state that the commonwealth virtual school shall be open to all students, on a space available basis, and shall not discriminate on the basis of race, color, national origin, religion, sex, gender identity or sexual orientation;

(9) a description of any preferences the school shall give for enrollment and how the school shall conduct a lottery for admission if applications exceed enrollment capacity;

(10) the identity of any third party software or curriculum vendors that the school intends to use;

(11) a proposed arrangement or contract with an organization that shall manage or operate the school, including any proposed or agreed upon payments to such organization;

(12) a demonstration of the applicant’s capacity to support and store all critical student, program and staff data for expedient retrieval and analysis in compliance with federal and state laws;

(13) provisions for cyber safety;

(14) how the school shall notify each school district in writing of the number and grade levels of students who shall be attending the commonwealth virtual school from that district within 10 days of the student registering for enrollment in the commonwealth virtual school;

(15) whether the commonwealth virtual school will offer online courses to students attending other schools;

(16) the financial plan for the operation of the school;

(17) the number and qualifications of teachers and administrators to be employed;

(18) the procedures for evaluation and professional development for teachers and administrators, including what training, if any, shall be provided to teachers who have not previously taught online;

(19) the school’s capacity to address the particular needs of English language learners to learn English and learn content matter;

(20) the school’s plan to conduct outreach to prospective students;

(21) what supports shall be provided to students to help them complete courses, including the school’s strategies for ensuring that an enrolled student shall complete the program and goals regarding course completion and student achievement;

(22) how the school will monitor student progress in order to identify areas of difficulty and assist students who need additional attention;

(23) where relevant, what supports will be provided to help students prepare for college and careers;

(24) the school’s capacity to support students’ social and emotional growth;

(25) how the school shall create a community for students who are enrolled in the commonwealth virtual school;

(26) how the commonwealth virtual school applicant shall include activities to engage students;

(27) what, if any, in person activities, learning or interaction will be provided or offered, including extra-curricular activities;

(28) expectations for age appropriate supervision of students under the age of 14, if applicable;

(29) a description of where students will access the school’s courses, including whether it is in the home or in a location provided and overseen by the commonwealth virtual school applicant;

(30) methods to assure that all students shall have access to necessary technology and materials;

(31) what technical support shall be available to students, including whether the commonwealth virtual school applicant shall offer an orientation for taking an online course before starting the coursework;

(32) how the school shall define and monitor student attendance, including how it shall verify that each student is participating in classes, how truancy shall be addressed and goals regarding student attendance;

(33) expectations and goals for communication between teachers and students and how such interaction shall be documented;

(34) how the school shall involve parents and guardians as partners in the education of the children and goals for parental and family engagement;

(35) the school’s capacity to implement the proposal and provide high quality instructional services;

(36) the school’s capacity to instruct students in the following categories, if the school intends to serve any such students: (i) students with physical or other challenges that make it difficult for them to physically attend a school; (ii) students with medical needs requiring a home or hospital setting; (iii) students with unusual needs requiring a flexible schedule; (iv) students who are over-age for their grade; (v) students who have been expelled; (vi) students who have dropped out or are at risk of dropping out; (vii) students who are pregnant or have a child; (viii) students with social and emotional challenges that make it difficult for them to physically attend a school; (ix) students who feel bullied or cannot attend school because their safety is at risk; (x) gifted and talented students; (xi) students who seek academic work not available in their school; (xii) students in rural communities; and (xiii) students in institutionalized settings;

(37) whether the school proposes a mechanism to provide meals to students eligible for free and reduced price lunch;

(38) the student to teacher ratio; and

(39) whether the school will establish a personalized learning plan for each student, in conjunction with the student’s school district of residence.

(c) The board shall make the final determination on selecting proposals; provided, however, that the board shall only grant a certificate to a qualified applicant as determined by the board; provided further, that the board shall hold a public hearing on the proposals which shall be attended by at least 1 member of the board. Not more than 10 commonwealth virtual schools shall be allowed to operate in the commonwealth at any time; provided, however, that a commonwealth virtual school operated by a single school district, under an agreement entered into by more than 1 school district or by an education collaborative shall not be counted towards this limit if the commonwealth virtual school only enrolls students who reside in the school district, in the school districts that signed the agreement or in the school districts that are members of an education collaborative. The board may authorize a single board of trustees to manage more than 1 commonwealth virtual school; provided, however, that each school is issued its own certificate. Under no circumstances shall the total number of full-time students attending commonwealth virtual schools exceed 2 per cent of the total number of students attending public schools in the commonwealth. In the case of a commonwealth virtual school that is established by a school district, not less than 5 per cent of the students enrolled in the commonwealth virtual school shall be from the school district that established the school. In the case of a commonwealth virtual school that is established by more than 1 school district or by an education collaborative, not less than 5 per cent of the students enrolled in the school shall be from the combined enrollment of the districts that established the school or the districts that are members of the education collaborative.

The board shall give preference to proposals that include an educational program or specialized focus that appropriately addresses 1 or more of the following: students with physical or other challenges that make it difficult for them to physically attend a school; students with medical needs requiring a home or hospital setting; students with unusual needs requiring a flexible schedule; students who are over-age for their grade; students who have been expelled; students who have dropped out; students at risk of dropping out; students who are pregnant or have a child; students with social and emotional challenges that make it difficult for them to physically attend a school; students who feel bullied or cannot attend school because the students’ safety is at risk; gifted and talented students; students who seek academic work not available in their school; students in rural communities; and students in institutionalized settings. The board shall also consider whether proposed schools will create or enhance the opportunity for students to attend virtual schools in all grades from kindergarten through grade 12.

(d) A commonwealth virtual school shall operate under a certificate issued by the board and be governed by a board of trustees. If a district or education collaborative operates the commonwealth virtual school, then the board of trustees shall be appointed by the member school committees of the district or the collaborative board. The board of trustees of a commonwealth virtual school, upon being granted a certificate, shall be deemed to be a public agent authorized by the commonwealth to supervise and control the commonwealth virtual school. A commonwealth virtual school shall be deemed to be a state agency under chapter 268A and members of the board of trustees shall be deemed to be public employees under chapter 268B.

(e) The board of trustees of a commonwealth virtual school shall have all powers necessary or desirable for carrying out its virtual program, including, but not limited to, the power to:

(1) adopt a name and corporate seal; provided, that any name selected shall include the words “commonwealth virtual school”;

(2) acquire real property, from public or private sources, by lease, lease with an option to purchase or by gift, for use as a school facility;

(3) receive and disburse funds for school purposes;

(4) incur temporary debt in anticipation of receipt of funds; provided that, notwithstanding any general or special law to the contrary, the terms of repayment of any commonwealth virtual school’s debt shall not exceed the duration of the school’s certificate without the approval of the board;

(5) solicit and accept grants or gifts for school purposes; and

(6) determine the school’s curriculum and develop the school’s annual budget.

(f) A commonwealth virtual school may provide access to its courses in an existing public school building or any other suitable location; provided, however, that a commonwealth virtual school shall comply with all applicable state and federal health and safety laws and regulations.

(g) The board may waive requirements that students who attend a commonwealth virtual school, attend school for a minimum number of hours or days each school year and may permit students to earn credits by demonstrating competency in a grade or subject matter. Students in commonwealth virtual schools shall be required to meet the same academic standards, testing and portfolio requirements set by the board for students in other public schools.

To ensure that students are learning and demonstrating their knowledge, each commonwealth virtual school shall ensure that students are provided, in each credit-bearing course, multiple synchronous learning opportunities with their teachers in which students are required to participate and share their knowledge.

(h) Commonwealth virtual schools shall comply with chapter 71B; provided, however, that the fiscal responsibility for a student with a disability enrolled in or determined to require a private day or residential school shall remain with the school district where the student resides. If a commonwealth virtual school expects that a student with a disability enrolled in the commonwealth virtual school may be in need of the services of a private day or residential school, it shall convene an individualized education program team meeting for the student. Notice of the team meeting shall be provided to the special education department of the school district in which the child resides at least 5 days in advance. Personnel from the school district in which the child resides shall participate in the team meeting concerning future placement of and services for the child and shall agree on the needed services for the child.

(i) No teacher shall be hired by a commonwealth virtual school who is not certified pursuant to section 38G. Nothing herein shall preclude such teacher from using digital content which may include, but not be limited to, guest lecturers.

(j) A certificate to operate a commonwealth virtual school granted by the board shall be for not less than 3 years and not more than 5 years, as determined by the board. The board shall develop procedures and guidelines for amending, revoking and renewing a virtual school’s certificate. When deciding on certificate renewal, the board shall consider progress made in student academic achievement and whether the school has met its obligations and commitments under the certificate.

(k) The amount of tuition per pupil a school district shall pay for a student residing in the district who is enrolled in a commonwealth virtual school shall be the school choice tuition amount, which shall be paid through the school choice mechanism; provided, that the department may, in consultation with the operational services division, approve alternative tuition amounts proposed by applicants that shall not exceed the state average per pupil foundation budget for students of the same classification and grade level; provided, further, that the department may authorize additional tuition assessments for services required by an individualized education program established pursuant to chapter 71B. If a commonwealth virtual school offers online courses to students attending other schools, the commonwealth virtual school shall work with the student’s district or school to determine whether the online courses meet said district’s or school’s standards and requirements and what the commonwealth virtual school will charge the student’s district or school for such online courses.

The department may retain not more than $75 per pupil for the administration of the commonwealth virtual school program.

The department, in consultation with the department of youth services, shall determine the appropriate tuition responsibility for students who are in the custody of the department of corrections, a sheriff or the department of youth services.

Students enrolled in a commonwealth virtual school shall be counted in the foundation enrollment of the school district where the student resides.

(l) The department shall promulgate rules and regulations creating a reporting requirement for a commonwealth virtual school’s net asset balance at the end of each fiscal year; provided, however, that the report shall include, but not be limited to: (1) the revenue and expenditures for the prior fiscal year with a specific accounting of the uses of public and private dollars; (2) compensation and benefits for teachers, staff, administrators, executives and members of the board of trustees; (3) the amount of funds paid to a management company; (4) the sources of surplus funds, specifically whether the funds are private or public; (5) how surplus funds were used in the previous fiscal year; and (6) the planned use of surplus funds in the upcoming fiscal year and in future fiscal years. The board may establish limits for excess funds that may be retained by commonwealth virtual schools and may require commonwealth virtual schools to return excess funds to school districts.

(m) Each commonwealth virtual school shall submit an annual report, on or before January 1, to the board. The school shall make its report available to the public on its website. The annual report shall be in such form as may be prescribed by the board and shall include, but not be limited to: (1) a discussion of progress made toward the achievement of the goals set forth in the certificate; (2) a list of the programs and courses offered; (3) a description and number of the students enrolled in the commonwealth virtual school by grade level, the number of students eligible for free and reduced price lunch and the number of students who applied and were not admitted; (4) a financial statement describing by appropriate categories the revenue and expenditures for the prior fiscal year and a balance sheet describing the commonwealth virtual school’s assets, liabilities and fund balances or equities; (5) information regarding and a discussion of student attendance and participation; (6) information regarding and a discussion of student-teacher interaction; (7) information regarding and a discussion of student performance in the commonwealth virtual school, including data from state assessments and a comparison of students’ achievement against the achievement of the students in the sending district; (8) a discussion of how many courses were completed and not completed; (9) a discussion of how the school created a community for students; (10) what activities were included to engage students and how students participated in those activities; (11) a discussion of parental involvement; and (12) a discussion of the school’s outreach and recruitment efforts; provided, however, that said report shall include input from teachers and administrators at the virtual school and input from administrators in a district that has established a virtual school or districts that are members of an education collaborative that has established a virtual school.

(n) Each commonwealth virtual school shall maintain an accurate account of all its activities and all its receipts and expenditures and shall annually conduct an independent audit of its accounts. Such audit shall be filed annually, on or before January 1 with the department and the state auditor and shall be in a form prescribed by the state auditor. The state auditor may investigate the budget and finances of commonwealth virtual schools and their financial dealings, transactions and relationships and shall have the power to examine the records of commonwealth virtual schools and to prescribe methods of accounting and the rendering of periodic reports.

(o) On or before September 1, the commissioner shall furnish a supplemental report on the Massachusetts comprehensive assessment system performance results of students served by each commonwealth virtual school and on the racial, ethnic and socio-economic make-up of the students served by each commonwealth virtual school. The commissioner shall also provide information on the number of students enrolled in each commonwealth virtual school who have individualized education programs pursuant to chapter 71B. The department shall make such report available to the public on the department’s website.

(p) On or before September 1, the commissioner shall prepare a report on the implementation and impact of this section, including, but not limited to:

(1) the fiscal impact on sending districts;

(2) any necessary adjustments to tuition rates, including whether the amount should vary based on grade or type of school and the appropriate mechanism for funding virtual schools;

(3) information on course completion and student attendance and participation rates;

(4) the academic achievement of students attending commonwealth virtual schools;

(5) the level of supervision or support needed for students in elementary and middle school;

(6) the support necessary or helpful to ensure that students successfully complete online courses;

(7) the professional development virtual school teachers require;

(8) the appropriate enrollment limit for a virtual school, if any, including information about wait lists; and

(9) the need for any changes to the commonwealth virtual school program.

The report shall be based partially on information in each commonwealth virtual school’s annual report and financial audits. This report shall include input from virtual school teachers and administrators. The commissioner shall consult with the digital learning advisory council to prepare this report. The commissioner shall file the report with the clerks of the house and senate, who shall forward the report to the joint committee on education. The department shall make the report available to the public on the department’s website.

(q) The commissioner shall identify and offer information on online courses which are aligned with state academic standards that districts may use and shall publish that list on the department’s website. At least 1 of the online courses listed shall be available at no cost to school districts, provided that such no cost online course is aligned with state academic standards. The list shall be reviewed and updated annually. Nothing in this subsection shall preclude school districts from using other courses not identified by the commissioner.

(r) The board may promulgate regulations for implementation and enforcement of this section, provided that the regulations may include, but shall not be limited to, a provision indicating the appropriate percentage of online academic instruction provided for a school to be considered a commonwealth virtual school pursuant to this section. Upon release of the proposed regulations, the board shall file a copy of the regulations with the clerks of the house of representatives and the senate, who shall forward the regulations to the joint committee on education. Within 30 days of the filing, the committee may hold a public hearing and issue a report on the regulations and file the report with the board. The board, pursuant to applicable law, may adopt final regulations making revisions to the proposed regulations as it deems appropriate after consideration of the report and shall file a copy of the regulations with the chairpersons of the joint committee on education and, not earlier than 30 days after the filing, the board shall file the final regulations with the state secretary.

(s) Nothing in this section shall preclude a student from taking some or all of the student’s classes online when such classes are offered or approved by the school the student attends or by an education collaborative in which the student’s school district participates.

This section shall not apply to a virtual school operated by a single school district if the school enrolls only students residing in the school district; provided, however, that such district shall submit a summary description of the proposed virtual school to the commissioner for review and comment at least 4 months in advance of the opening of the virtual school. The commissioner shall then provide written comments on the proposal to each district’s school committee.

(t) A school committee may, by vote, restrict enrollment of its students in commonwealth virtual schools if the total enrollment of its students in commonwealth virtual schools exceeds 1 per cent of the total enrollment in its district; provided, however, that no student enrolled in a commonwealth virtual school shall be compelled to withdraw as a result of that vote.

# Appendix B: CMVS Tuition by District of Residence, FY17

*Sorted on FY17 FTE CMVS enrollment.*

| **District of Residence** | **FY17 FTE CMVS Enrollment** | **FY17 Tuition** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Springfield | 126.2 | $880,992 |
| Boston | 111.9 | $776,526 |
| Worcester | 61.1 | $417,796 |
| New Bedford | 54.2 | $372,163 |
| Fall River | 36.1 | $251,727 |
| Lowell | 30.5 | $215,217 |
| Brockton | 28.7 | $195,184 |
| Lynn | 28.5 | $199,975 |
| Chicopee | 27.0 | $185,646 |
| Lawrence | 26.2 | $186,611 |
| Taunton | 26.0 | $180,662 |
| Pittsfield | 25.0 | $173,061 |
| Haverhill | 23.9 | $161,837 |
| Attleboro | 22.3 | $157,650 |
| Westfield | 19.7 | $139,629 |
| Weymouth | 19.5 | $133,188 |
| Methuen | 18.4 | $127,030 |
| Wareham | 18.0 | $124,840 |
| Southbridge | 18.0 | $122,196 |
| Dudley Charlton | 17.3 | $118,731 |
| Gardner | 15.9 | $109,033 |
| Barnstable | 15.6 | $111,008 |
| Sandwich | 15.0 | $106,444 |
| Fitchburg | 14.4 | $109,510 |
| Agawam | 14.4 | $102,989 |
| Dennis Yarmouth | 14.3 | $98,779 |
| Greenfield | 14.2 | $109,380 |
| Grafton | 14.1 | $98,808 |
| Waltham | 13.9 | $94,940 |
| West Springfield | 13.8 | $92,791 |
| Billerica | 13.6 | $93,057 |
| Holyoke | 13.5 | $91,269 |
| Athol Royalston | 13.4 | $95,469 |
| Middleborough | 13.4 | $92,019 |
| Leominster | 13.2 | $94,657 |
| Framingham | 13.0 | $91,229 |
| Wachusett | 12.8 | $84,733 |
| Beverly | 12.4 | $89,715 |
| Quabbin | 12.2 | $94,961 |
| Webster | 12.2 | $91,193 |
| Rockland | 12.0 | $83,654 |
| Quincy | 11.9 | $81,802 |
| Franklin | 11.9 | $83,809 |
| North Attleborough | 11.8 | $78,918 |
| Belchertown | 11.8 | $79,204 |
| Plymouth | 11.3 | $82,414 |
| Stoughton | 11.0 | $75,077 |
| Salem | 10.7 | $71,153 |
| Peabody | 10.6 | $72,465 |
| Marlborough | 10.6 | $72,309 |
| Randolph | 9.7 | $68,667 |
| Ludlow | 9.6 | $67,755 |
| Oxford | 9.4 | $63,676 |
| Woburn | 9.4 | $63,082 |
| Monomoy | 9.0 | $67,262 |
| Millbury | 9.0 | $61,697 |
| Palmer | 8.9 | $63,220 |
| Bellingham | 8.9 | $59,845 |
| Hampden Wilbraham | 8.7 | $61,513 |
| Revere | 8.6 | $57,038 |
| King Philip | 8.5 | $56,445 |
| Hudson | 8.5 | $59,495 |
| Ashburnham Westminster | 8.4 | $56,820 |
| Watertown | 8.4 | $57,842 |
| Norton | 8.4 | $56,296 |
| Malden | 8.3 | $56,760 |
| Andover | 8.3 | $55,716 |
| Spencer East Brookfield | 8.3 | $56,956 |
| Chelmsford | 8.0 | $52,735 |
| Wakefield | 7.9 | $52,536 |
| Bridgewater Raynham | 7.9 | $54,462 |
| Hampshire | 7.9 | $53,198 |
| Monson | 7.9 | $52,074 |
| Danvers | 7.8 | $52,811 |
| North Middlesex | 7.8 | $51,543 |
| Pentucket | 7.8 | $56,335 |
| Ayer Shirley | 7.7 | $50,946 |
| Tewksbury | 7.6 | $52,684 |
| Holbrook | 7.6 | $50,021 |
| Saugus | 7.6 | $50,020 |
| Northbridge | 7.5 | $50,968 |
| Nashoba | 7.5 | $49,490 |
| Everett | 7.4 | $51,429 |
| Auburn | 7.4 | $50,354 |
| Dighton Rehoboth | 7.3 | $50,323 |
| Dracut | 7.2 | $49,244 |
| Shrewsbury | 7.1 | $47,194 |
| Pembroke | 7.1 | $47,368 |
| Walpole | 7.0 | $46,707 |
| Quaboag | 7.0 | $46,508 |
| Burlington | 6.9 | $45,912 |
| Hopedale | 6.9 | $55,503 |
| Uxbridge | 6.9 | $48,164 |
| Freetown Lakeville | 6.8 | $50,888 |
| Douglas | 6.7 | $46,663 |
| Milford | 6.7 | $46,681 |
| Amesbury | 6.7 | $45,972 |
| Triton | 6.6 | $45,183 |
| Blackstone Millville | 6.6 | $44,581 |
| Reading | 6.6 | $44,397 |
| Hatfield | 6.5 | $42,930 |
| Acushnet | 6.5 | $43,744 |
| Newton | 6.4 | $42,070 |
| Chelsea | 6.3 | $42,925 |
| Swampscott | 6.3 | $44,304 |
| Melrose | 6.3 | $42,400 |
| Norwood | 6.0 | $46,070 |
| Abington | 6.0 | $39,684 |
| Natick | 5.9 | $43,121 |
| Lexington | 5.8 | $39,141 |
| Winchendon | 5.7 | $39,126 |
| Easton | 5.7 | $41,866 |
| Westborough | 5.7 | $37,763 |
| Braintree | 5.5 | $41,984 |
| Needham | 5.5 | $36,173 |
| Carver | 5.4 | $42,934 |
| North Brookfield | 5.4 | $39,414 |
| Mendon Upton | 5.2 | $34,541 |
| Gloucester | 5.1 | $35,702 |
| Old Rochester | 5.0 | $35,027 |
| Marshfield | 5.0 | $33,513 |
| North Andover | 4.9 | $35,069 |
| Bourne | 4.8 | $33,333 |
| Ipswich | 4.8 | $31,535 |
| Newburyport | 4.8 | $33,208 |
| Hingham | 4.7 | $31,852 |
| Medford | 4.7 | $40,153 |
| North Reading | 4.7 | $32,630 |
| Milton | 4.5 | $30,078 |
| Dartmouth | 4.4 | $29,349 |
| Gateway | 4.4 | $29,682 |
| Northboro Southboro | 4.3 | $28,753 |
| Fairhaven | 4.3 | $29,156 |
| Groton Dunstable | 4.3 | $30,151 |
| West Boylston | 4.1 | $26,964 |
| Westport | 3.9 | $28,238 |
| Falmouth | 3.9 | $27,023 |
| Mohawk Trail | 3.8 | $26,474 |
| Marblehead | 3.8 | $26,128 |
| Ralph C Mahar | 3.8 | $25,148 |
| Winchester | 3.7 | $24,711 |
| Hull | 3.7 | $25,499 |
| Brookline | 3.6 | $24,175 |
| Medfield | 3.6 | $30,159 |
| Foxborough | 3.6 | $23,778 |
| Narragansett | 3.5 | $23,387 |
| Lunenburg | 3.5 | $24,248 |
| Amherst Pelham | 3.5 | $23,297 |
| Winthrop | 3.4 | $22,724 |
| Southborough | 3.4 | $22,591 |
| Whitman Hanson | 3.4 | $23,894 |
| Acton Boxborough | 3.4 | $22,644 |
| Concord Carlisle | 3.4 | $22,326 |
| Silver Lake | 3.3 | $22,921 |
| Southwick Tolland | 3.3 | $22,217 |
| Scituate | 3.3 | $21,862 |
| Central Berkshire | 3.3 | $25,176 |
| Clinton | 3.3 | $21,532 |
| Seekonk | 3.2 | $27,063 |
| Georgetown | 3.2 | $21,399 |
| Westford | 3.2 | $21,267 |
| Hadley | 3.1 | $24,962 |
| Tantasqua | 3.1 | $20,406 |
| Sharon | 3.1 | $21,687 |
| Berlin Boylston | 3.1 | $20,272 |
| Holliston | 3.0 | $20,140 |
| Stoneham | 3.0 | $21,621 |
| Granby | 3.0 | $19,875 |
| Somerville | 3.0 | $19,875 |
| Swansea | 3.0 | $19,809 |
| West Bridgewater | 3.0 | $20,368 |
| Cambridge | 3.0 | $19,610 |
| Tyngsborough | 2.9 | $19,478 |
| Nauset | 2.9 | $19,346 |
| Somerset | 2.9 | $26,048 |
| Canton | 2.8 | $18,683 |
| Wilmington | 2.8 | $18,418 |
| Ware | 2.6 | $17,424 |
| Dedham | 2.6 | $17,225 |
| Lincoln Sudbury | 2.5 | $16,828 |
| Duxbury | 2.5 | $17,690 |
| Northampton | 2.5 | $16,629 |
| Concord | 2.4 | $15,966 |
| Longmeadow | 2.4 | $15,768 |
| Marthas Vineyard | 2.3 | $18,016 |
| Nantucket | 2.3 | $14,973 |
| Dover Sherborn | 2.2 | $14,509 |
| Hamilton Wenham | 2.2 | $15,834 |
| Medway | 2.1 | $14,809 |
| Maynard | 2.1 | $13,847 |
| Millis | 2.1 | $14,399 |
| Arlington | 2.0 | $13,717 |
| Norwell | 2.0 | $14,257 |
| Southampton | 2.0 | $13,250 |
| Ashland | 2.0 | $14,111 |
| East Bridgewater | 1.9 | $12,654 |
| Adams Cheshire | 1.9 | $18,554 |
| Easthampton | 1.8 | $11,727 |
| Leicester | 1.8 | $11,727 |
| Cohasset | 1.7 | $12,091 |
| Northborough | 1.6 | $10,622 |
| North Adams | 1.5 | $10,284 |
| Weston | 1.5 | $10,136 |
| Bedford | 1.5 | $10,070 |
| East Longmeadow | 1.5 | $9,872 |
| Sutton | 1.5 | $9,805 |
| South Hadley | 1.5 | $13,238 |
| Sudbury | 1.5 | $9,673 |
| Mansfield | 1.5 | $10,101 |
| Sturbridge | 1.4 | $39,570 |
| Wayland | 1.4 | $9,143 |
| Mashpee | 1.4 | $9,520 |
| Hopkinton | 1.3 | $8,613 |
| Pioneer | 1.3 | $10,815 |
| Littleton | 1.2 | $8,583 |
| Avon | 1.2 | $8,906 |
| Belmont | 1.2 | $7,884 |
| Manchester Essex | 1.1 | $7,879 |
| Wellesley | 1.1 | $7,023 |
| Erving | 1.0 | $6,625 |
| Frontier | 1.0 | $6,625 |
| Norfolk | 1.0 | $6,625 |
| Westwood | 1.0 | $6,625 |
| Masconomet | 0.9 | $6,330 |
| Somerset Berkley | 0.9 | $6,086 |
| Wales | 0.7 | $4,505 |
| Lenox | 0.7 | $4,307 |
| Lee | 0.4 | $2,782 |
| Hanover | 0.4 | $3,116 |
| Berkshire Hills | 0.3 | $1,723 |
| Kingston | 0.1 | $596 |
| Orange | 0.1 | $530 |
| Orleans | 0.0 | $199 |
| **Total** | **1926.2** | **$13,397,669** |

# Appendix C: Academic Achievement Data

**Next Generation MCAS Tests of Spring 2017 - Percent of Students at Each Achievement Level for GCVS**

|  | Meeting or Exceeding Expectations | | Exceeding Expectations | | Meeting Expectations | | Partially Meeting Expectations | | Not Meeting Expectations | | Included | Avg. Scaled Score | SGP | Included in SGP |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| GCVS | State | GCVS | State | GCVS | State | GCVS | State | GCVS | State |
| Grade 3 - Reading | 33 | 47 | 6 | 8 | 27 | 39 | 47 | 42 | 20 | 10 | 51 | 488.9 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 3 - Math | 22 | 49 | 2 | 7 | 20 | 42 | 53 | 38 | 24 | 13 | 49 | 482.9 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 4 - ELA | 17 | 48 | 0 | 7 | 17 | 41 | 63 | 42 | 20 | 10 | 46 | 485.9 | 31 | 32 |
| Grade 4 - Math | 15 | 49 | 0 | 6 | 15 | 43 | 37 | 39 | 48 | 13 | 46 | 475.2 | 40 | 33 |
| Grade 5 - ELA | 23 | 49 | 3 | 6 | 21 | 43 | 51 | 42 | 26 | 10 | 39 | 486.1 | 45 | 33 |
| Grade 5 - Math | 23 | 46 | 0 | 7 | 23 | 39 | 46 | 44 | 31 | 10 | 39 | 485.6 | 28 | 33 |
| Grade 6 - ELA | 24 | 51 | 2 | 7 | 22 | 43 | 64 | 39 | 13 | 10 | 55 | 488.1 | 33 | 39 |
| Grade 6 - Math | 13 | 50 | 2 | 7 | 11 | 42 | 57 | 39 | 30 | 11 | 53 | 482.1 | 28 | 38 |
| Grade 7 - ELA | 32 | 50 | 0 | 6 | 32 | 44 | 48 | 39 | 20 | 11 | 65 | 488.3 | 27 | 44 |
| Grade 7 - Math | 22 | 47 | 0 | 9 | 22 | 38 | 45 | 42 | 34 | 12 | 65 | 482.1 | 33 | 44 |
| Grade 8 - ELA | 40 | 49 | 2 | 8 | 38 | 41 | 46 | 39 | 14 | 11 | 63 | 493.6 | 56.5 | 46 |
| Grade 8 - Math | 22 | 48 | 0 | 9 | 22 | 39 | 56 | 42 | 22 | 11 | 63 | 487.3 | 32 | 44 |
| Grades 3-8 - ELA | 29 | 49 | 2 | 7 | 27 | 42 | 53 | 41 | 18 | 10 | 319 | 488.8 | 37 | 194 |
| Grades 3-8 - Math | 20 | 48 | 1 | 8 | 19 | 40 | 49 | 41 | 31 | 12 | 315 | 482.7 | 31.5 | 192 |

**MCAS Tests of Spring 2017 - Percent of Students at Each Achievement Level for GCVS**

|  | Proficient or Higher | | Advanced | | Proficient | | Needs Improvement | | Warning/ Failing | | Included | CPI | SGP | Included in SGP |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| GCVS | State | GCVS | State | GCVS | State | GCVS | State | GCVS | State |
| Grade 5 - STE | 26 | 46 | 10 | 17 | 15 | 29 | 49 | 39 | 26 | 15 | 39 | 62.8 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 8 - STE | 21 | 40 | 0 | 3 | 21 | 37 | 52 | 40 | 27 | 20 | 63 | 60.7 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 10 - ELA | 89 | 91 | 30 | 47 | 59 | 44 | 11 | 6 | 0 | 3 | 46 | 96.2 | 35 | 30 |
| Grade 10 - Math | 66 | 79 | 36 | 53 | 30 | 26 | 20 | 14 | 14 | 8 | 44 | 81.8 | 34 | 26 |
| Grade 10 - STE | 68 | 74 | 26 | 32 | 42 | 42 | 26 | 21 | 5 | 5 | 19 | 86.8 | N/A | N/A |
| NOTE: Grade 10 STE results are reported based on students' best performance on any STE test taken in grade 9 or grade 10; only students continuously enrolled in the state, district, or school from fall of grade 9 through spring of grade 10 are included in state and school results. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

**Next Generation MCAS Tests of Spring 2017 - Percent of Students at Each Achievement Level for TECCA**

| Grade and Subject | Meeting or Exceeding Expectations | | Exceeding Expectations | | Meeting Expectations | | Partially Meeting Expectations | | Not Meeting Expectations | | Included | Avg. Scaled Score | SGP | Included in SGP |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| TECCA | State | TECCA | State | TECCA | State | TECCA | State | TECCA | State |
| Grade 3 - Reading | 27 | 47 | 0 | 8 | 27 | 39 | 54 | 42 | 19 | 10 | 37 | 486 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 3 - Math | 32 | 49 | 0 | 7 | 32 | 42 | 35 | 38 | 32 | 13 | 37 | 484.6 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 4 - ELA | 20 | 48 | 0 | 7 | 20 | 41 | 53 | 42 | 27 | 10 | 30 | 483.6 | N/A | 15 |
| Grade 4 - Math | 21 | 49 | 0 | 6 | 21 | 43 | 33 | 39 | 45 | 13 | 33 | 474 | N/A | 14 |
| Grade 5 - ELA | 19 | 49 | 0 | 6 | 19 | 43 | 60 | 42 | 21 | 10 | 47 | 482.5 | 32 | 21 |
| Grade 5 - Math | 15 | 46 | 2 | 7 | 13 | 39 | 36 | 44 | 49 | 10 | 47 | 477.2 | 19.5 | 20 |
| Grade 6 - ELA | 33 | 51 | 0 | 7 | 33 | 43 | 59 | 39 | 9 | 10 | 80 | 491.1 | 28.5 | 38 |
| Grade 6 - Math | 20 | 50 | 1 | 7 | 18 | 42 | 55 | 39 | 25 | 11 | 76 | 483.5 | 24 | 39 |
| Grade 7 - ELA | 27 | 50 | 3 | 6 | 24 | 44 | 60 | 39 | 13 | 11 | 112 | 489.4 | 29 | 42 |
| Grade 7 - Math | 18 | 47 | 1 | 9 | 17 | 38 | 57 | 42 | 26 | 12 | 113 | 483.5 | 24 | 45 |
| Grade 8 - ELA | 35 | 49 | 3 | 8 | 32 | 41 | 53 | 39 | 12 | 11 | 144 | 493.8 | 39 | 69 |
| Grade 8 - Math | 21 | 48 | 0 | 9 | 21 | 39 | 63 | 42 | 16 | 11 | 140 | 485.8 | 16 | 69 |
| Grades 3-8 - ELA | 29 | 49 | 2 | 7 | 28 | 42 | 56 | 41 | 14 | 10 | 450 | 489.7 | 34 | 185 |
| Grades 3-8 - Math | 20 | 48 | 1 | 8 | 20 | 40 | 53 | 41 | 27 | 12 | 446 | 482.9 | 19 | 187 |

**MCAS Tests of Spring 2017 - Percent of Students at Each Achievement Level for TECCA**

| Grade and Subject | Proficient or Higher | | Advanced | | Proficient | | Needs Improvement | | Warning/ Failing | | Included | CPI | SGP | Included in SGP |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| TECCA | State | TECCA | State | TECCA | State | TECCA | State | TECCA | State |
| Grade 5 - STE | 21 | 46 | 9 | 17 | 13 | 29 | 40 | 39 | 38 | 15 | 47 | 58.5 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 8 - STE | 21 | 40 | 0 | 3 | 21 | 37 | 54 | 40 | 25 | 20 | 140 | 59.3 | N/A | N/A |
| Grade 10 - ELA | 92 | 91 | 27 | 47 | 64 | 44 | 7 | 6 | 1 | 3 | 157 | 97 | 33 | 57 |
| Grade 10 - Math | 61 | 79 | 27 | 53 | 34 | 26 | 30 | 14 | 9 | 8 | 151 | 81.8 | 20.5 | 56 |
| Grade 10 - STE | 67 | 74 | 15 | 32 | 51 | 42 | 31 | 21 | 3 | 5 | 39 | 86.5 | N/A | N/A |
| NOTE: Grade 10 STE results are reported based on students' best performance on any STE test taken in grade 9 or grade 10; only students continuously enrolled in the state, district, or school from fall of grade 9 through spring of grade 10 are included in state and school results. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

1. GCVS has a certificate to operate from July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2019. TECCA has a certificate to operate from July 1, 2017 through June 30, 2021. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. http://profiles.doe.mass.edu/profiles/general.aspx?topNavId=1&orgcode=39020900&orgtypecode=6& [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. The tuition for special education students is the cost of providing the special education required by the student. G.L. c. 71, § 94(k). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. The per pupil tuition rate of $6,700 was set by the Board on June 25, 2013 when it voted to approve a certificate for GCVS. The Board approved the same rate for TECCA on February 25, 2014. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. GCVS did not provide course completion data due to a change in the school’s online learning management system. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. The “high needs” category includes any student identified as economically disadvantaged, English learners, or students with disabilities. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. TECCA presented to the DLAC on November 18, 2015; January 6, 2016; February 25, 2016; September 13, 2016; and October 14, 2016. GCVS made presentations on February 25, 2016, and October 14, 2016. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Virtual schools have larger class sizes and higher student-teacher ratios than the state average (13.2 to 1). In FY17 GCVS had a student-teacher ratio of 21.5 to 1, and TECCA’s student-teacher ratio was 30.2 to 1. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. On average, GCVS teachers earn 36 percent less than their counterparts in brick-and-mortar schools and TECCA teachers earn 32 percent less. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. G.L. c.71, §94(c), states that the Board

    shall give preference to proposals that include an educational program or specialized focus that appropriately addresses 1 or more of the following: students with physical or other challenges that make it difficult for them to physically attend a school; students with medical needs requiring a home or hospital setting; students with unusual needs requiring a flexible schedule; students who are over-age for their grade; students who have been expelled; students who have dropped out; students at risk of dropping out; students who are pregnant or have a child; students with social and emotional challenges that make it difficult for them to physically attend a school; students who feel bullied or cannot attend school because the students' safety is at risk; gifted and talented students; students who seek academic work not available in their school; students in rural communities; and students in institutionalized settings. The board shall also consider whether proposed schools will create or enhance the opportunity for students to attend virtual schools in all grades from kindergarten through grade 12. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. These data were presented to the Board on February 17, 2017; for details, refer to Attachment D. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. For example, Battaglino, Halderman & Laurans (2012) estimated a $6,400 per pupil cost for a “full virtual model” when the following cost factors are considered: labor, content acquisition, technology and infrastructure, school operations, and student-support services. They noted the cost could vary as much as 20 percent in either direction based on resource allocation across those categories. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. A 2016 study of virtual charter schools by the University of Southern Maine (Johnson, A.F., Hopper, F. & Sloan, J.E.) reported that among states that permit the operation of virtual charter schools, the majority fund these schools on a par with brick-and-mortar charter schools and/or non-charter public schools. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Consistent with the state school choice program, the CMVS, as a receiving district, bills the costs of special education services to the students’ district of residence. The CMVS is programmatically responsible for arranging for those services. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. $8,265 less $75 per pupil retained by the Department for program administration. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)